"WE CAN'T JUST CHANGE THE WHOLE CURRICULUM FOR COLOURED PEOPLE"

Exploring the Effects of a Predominantly White, Middle Class Music Curriculum on the Musical Behaviour and Identity of Black and Ethnic Minority People

Natasha Hendry

Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the MA in Music Psychology in Education, Performance and Wellbeing

July 2021

Department of Music, University of Sheffield

ABSTRACT

US research suggests that the Western Music Curriculum favours Eurocentric ideals and harbours a dominant 'white' culture. Education academics argue that this puts many of the increasingly diverse and multicultural studentship in schools today at a disadvantage. With little knowledge of the experiences of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) music students or music professionals in the UK, this study aimed to fill a gap in the research by conducting an exploratory study. The experiences of three categories of Black and ethnic minority participants were gathered via in-depth semi-structured interviews and focus groups. This method provided a good overview of music education both from a teacher and pupil perspective. Utilising a biographical method enabled the researcher to examine the journey of 11 Black and Ethnic Minority adults from their early experiences within the UK music education system right up to their present professional careers in music. Focus groups with 10 pupils currently engaged in music education in UK schools offered a current perspective and comparison with adults' experiences, which allowed for reflection on possible trajectories.

The research question asked whether a predominantly white, middle-class music curriculum has an effect on the musical behaviours and identity of BAME people in the UK? Findings from this study suggest that people from a BAME background, experience considerable barriers in music education and musical careers, which have an adverse psychological effect later in life. For Musicians the music industry environment was also heavily implicated in psychological distress for BAME individuals. Participants also identified several means of Agency for BAME people in music, pertaining to Black culture, supportive teachers and mentors and opportunities and chances. Recommendations for music education and the music industry are suggested encouraging an anti-racist stance and greater diversity and ethnic representation in personnel and practice.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you…

- To the 'rare breed' of Black and Ethnic Minority Music Teachers who are changing the landscape of Music Education.

- The talented musicians who shared their stories with me openly and honestly and for providing role models for this generation of young people and the next.

- To my supervisor Dr Stephanie Pitts for your knowledge and sound instruction and for persuading me about the importance of this research.

- To my amazing husband Craig who has held me and our family together through all this studying, you always live up to your name – my rock.

- To my ever-encouraging sister and inspiration, Loretta Andrews. Thanks for always having my back and all the proof-reading you do! - *Partner in the Womb.*

- To my friends Nic, Jules & Susi for always cheering me on and sending encouragement just when I needed it.

- To Charisse Beaumont and Black Lives in Music for championing me and playing your significant part in 'doing the work' in a profound and powerful way.

- **To every Black and Ethnic Minority musician or aspiring musician out there, whatever the genre, this is for you.**

CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

INTRODUCTION

Research suggests that the western music curriculum is overwhelmingly 'white' in its content, delivery style and deliverers (teachers) (Hess, 2017; Glazier, 2003; Clark & Medina, 2000). This is despite a steady increase in students from minority ethnicities (Justiz & Kameen, 1988; Westerlund et al., 2017; DfE, 2018). It can be argued that this status quo is perpetuated by the fact that as predominantly white children and white middle-class cultural values are catered for in the music room, these children are set to become the music teachers of tomorrow and so continue the cycle (Bradley et al., 2007). Black and other ethnic minority students are less likely to see themselves reflected in their educators, as Government statistics and other research show a White dominance in the teacher workforce (HM Government, 2020; Tereshchenko et al., 2020). This points to a wider problem of racial disparities in the education system, however as a music educator and professional musician of Black Mixed-race heritage, I am keen to know what this means for the next generation of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) music makers. Racial disparities between teachers are likely to be evident in all subjects, however whilst US research has produced findings and statistical data on Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) music teachers (Elpus, 2015; Bates, 2019), in the UK there remains none. Research displays opposing views on the rationale for teacher diversity and whether it is important, how and who for. Whilst some research shows BME teachers see themselves as role models for BAME students (Haque & Elliott, 2007), other research suggests that data on the assertion that role-modelling via teachers of colour is important is not robust (Villegas & Irvine, 2010). Whilst research substantiates that classical music has dominated the western music curriculum (Westerlund et al., 2017) it is not possible to say whether this has a positive,

negative or inconsequential effect on students, especially from a BAME background, due to a gap in the research. Literature does suggest a strong association between classical music and the white, middle-classes (Bull, 2019; Nwanoku, 2019; Ross, 2020) and therefore it would seem reasonable to question what this means for the personal and musical identities of BAME students of music. MacDonald et al. (2002) assert that one of the primary social purposes of music is in helping individuals develop a sense of personal identity. Understanding how musical identity might be affected without the representation of ones' own cultural music practices could be important for the future of music education and promoting social justice in the classroom, as well as our growing multicultural society. Similarly, whilst research has examined the effects of racial stereotyping for example on academic behaviour and educational outcomes (Cvencek at al., 2015), there is a scarce amount of data on how musical behaviour might be affected by race issues such as a lack of diversity in the music curriculum. The motivation behind this study was to carry out exploratory research into the aforementioned gaps in the literature and find out about the experiences of BAME individuals with the UK music curriculum. Of particular interest was how the dominance of essentially a white, middle-class genre; classical music, might be affecting the musical identities and musical behaviours of this population. The experiences of BAME adults with professional music careers, who were educated in the UK were examined to allow for a longitudinal view that might highlight associations between experiences and outcomes. Additionally, current secondary school students were examined in order to make comparisons with how BAME young people today experience UK music education.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Race Inequalities in Education

It is estimated that 40 per cent of students in the US are people of colour (POC), yet the percentage of teachers of colour is diminishing (Landsman 2009). UK government department for Education (DfE) statistics on school-teacher workforce reported that in 2018, over 85% of all teachers in English state-funded schools were White British (HM Government, 2020). More recently Tereshchenko et al., (2020) reported that 46% of all schools in England have no BAME teachers and even in ethnically diverse schools BAME teachers are underrepresented. Similar to the US, the ethnic minority population in Britain is also increasing (Alexander et al., 2015). On examining results from research published two years previous by the DfE, the BBC calculated that schools need an extra 68,000 Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) teachers to reflect the UK school population at that time (Rhodes, 2017). The greatest disparities were shown in the London borough of Westminster where Government figures showed less than 40% BAME teachers compared with 85% of students from an ethnic minority background. Music education appears to reflect these disparities in the US, with Bates (2019) reporting that the Black population represent only 7% of music teachers, whilst accounting for 14% of the US population. However, there is no existing research on UK state school music teachers and ethnicity. The US have also led the way with research on ethnic diversity within the western music curriculum content. Researchers report a dominance of Western classical music which they say favours Eurocentric ideals and promotes a reproduction of white ideology (Bradley, 2006; Bradley et al., 2007; Hess, 2017). Bradley (2007) asserts,

> The narrow focus on Western art music found in many university music programs maintains the institution's focus on white culture. The lack of substantive change in postsecondary music programs (despite profound changes in the school population that music teacher graduates will serve) assures the reproduction of whiteness within music education. (Bradley, 2007, p. 148).

Colonialism and 'Whiteness' in Music Education

In Bradley's (2007) discourse on race in music education, she argues that music educators should work towards gaining more social justice within music education. This, she states involves making music education more inclusive which can only be done by understanding the experiences of the least advantaged. Bradley highlights a need to "discuss race directly and meaningfully" (p 137) and states that, "Such discussions afford valuable opportunities to confront and evaluate the practical consequences of our actions as music educators." Colonialism in the curriculum has been a hot topic lately, with a call to make similar re-evaluations and challenges in all subjects (Charles, 2019; Sawchuk, 2021). Research suggests 'whiteness' as an ideology is seeping into many aspects of the education system (Gillborn, 2005; Charles, 2019). Research on social justice in music education in the US makes a distinction between 'white people' and 'whiteness'. Literature reports that making this distinction is important, both for tackling the right issues and enabling productive discourse on the subject. Critical Race Theory (CRT) is a helpful lens through which to understand this distinction. CRT asserts that race is a social construct and racial inequality is a product of legal systems and societal structures as opposed to individual prejudices and bias (Delgado et al., 2017). Critical Race theorists seeks to challenge the ideologies, assumptions, institutions and structures of society they claim perpetuate racial inequality (Zamudio et al., 2010). When Gillborn (2005) used CRT to

discuss education reform he noted that it was not extreme, outright displays of racism that posed the most danger “but rather the taken-for-granted routine privileging of white interests that goes unremarked in the political mainstream” (p 485).

Researchers do not appear to suggest that social justice in music education requires a removal of white teaching staff or white contributions to music education, this is not an attack on white people as some critics suggest (Sawchuk, 2021), although there is recognition for a need to address imbalance. Indeed, Bates (2019) claims that poor white people can be disadvantaged by whiteness. Drummond (2010) asserts that the answer is not to eradicate western classical music from the curriculum either, but instead re-categorize it and place it amongst a diverse range of other genres to ‘avoid neo-colonial attitudes’ (p117). This, he says, will ensure a preserving of the merit of the music itself and the status of the musicians involved in it. Zamudio et al. (2010) seem to support this concept as they claim, ‘Whiteness has more value in relation to other races as long as it maintains its exclusive privileges. The more other races are granted the rights and privileges of whiteness, the less value it maintains” (p 34). The complexities and difficulties with the concept of whiteness for white people is explored by Hyland (2005) in her discourse and ethnographic study on white teachers and black students. She proposes that a barrier to tackling whiteness in education is that it is often enforced unintentionally and via means desired to benefit pupils.

> Sometimes racism is inserted into schools simply by doing what is normal in those schools that primarily serve students of color, or even doing what is seemingly wonderful for students (Hyland, 2005, p 432)

A Fear of Discourse About Racism

There is no doubt that racism is uncomfortable to talk about and as Bradley (2007) says these are, "conversations many white educators find uncomfortable and prefer to avoid" (p 137). Not everyone will be as forthright and vociferous as Bradley who declares her intent to "interrogate whiteness within music education, including my own implications in white privilege" (p 138). Landsman (2001) explains that many white academics and educators can feel afraid of saying the wrong thing. The difficulty felt by white academics to talk about race issues, together with the lack of black and ethnic minority academics (Alexander et al., 2015; Adams, 2020) could give reason as to why there is a lack of research on this subject in the UK. These challenges of tackling race issues mean that much of the work of racial justice falls upon people of colour on the ground-level, who are experiencing the mental strain of the hidden workload of battling racial inequalities (Tereshchenko et al., 2020). Comparatively, musicians or students of music can also be reluctant to talk about race. In Scharff's (2018) study on classical music and inequality, she reported that white-privilege was not reflected upon by participants in their discussion of race. Scharff states that discussions on race were more ambiguous than class issues, which participants appeared to reflect on more freely. If race is discussed it is often from the perspective of colour-blindness which many scholars believe causes further damage to diverse students (Zamudio et al., 2010). Morrison (1992) says that ignoring race is damaging because difference is then discredited and further that this opting to not acknowledge colour and difference is often framed as a gesture of grace and liberalism that is misplaced. In the same way Glazier (2003) also explains that the practice of not acknowledging race differences is disheartening because "it assumes the non-existence of distinct cultures" (p

74). The concept of multiculturalism is also criticised as a tokenistic gesture and ineffective strategy for tackling racism in music education (Bradley, 2006; 2007). Social justice educators suggest that multiculturism in music education encourages tolerance, which is a far-cry from the preferred anti-racist position. Education researchers claim that an anti-racist stance in music education will widen representation in music lesson content, delivery style and teachers to reflect and validate the ethnic and cultural backgrounds of today's students (Bradley, 2007; Bates, 2019). This debate is growing in momentum in the US but remains a relatively untouched subject in the UK.

The intersection of Class and Race

Whilst UK studies have highlighted inequalities within music education (Scharff, 2017; Bull, 2019), they have tended to focus on issues of class and gender. Much focus has been given to the link between classical music, which dominates the western music curriculum (Bradley, 2006) and middle-class culture. Bull (2016) concludes from her research that "classical music in the UK is a predominantly middle-class taste and practice" (p. 126). Researchers such as Bates (2019) suggest there should be an intersectional approach to race and class with respect to addressing social justice in music education. As Bourdieu (1984, as cited in Bull, 2016) poignantly states, class is not only categorized by economics but also encompasses the cultural preferences and practices which establish the identity and position within a person's class. Education scholars agree that acknowledging intersections of struggle is important if the goal is to understand and be advocates for the least advantaged (Bradley, 2007; Bates, 2019). Bates (2019) found that many of the BAME participants involved in his study grew up in socially deprived areas. When Scharff (2015) examined equality and diversity in the classical music profession, in addition to gender

inequalities, she exposed clear class and race intersections in the disadvantages experienced by some musicians in training.

The 2015 study also suggested that although cost of instrument lessons was a barrier, it was not the most significant disadvantage experienced by working class ethnic minority music students. Instead, incongruence between music education culture and a person's culture at home posed the biggest obstacle. Scharff argues that music education culture is much more similar to middle-class culture putting students from that background at an advantage. The study went on to reveal that a high proportion of conservatoire students attended private schools where middle-class norms and cultural practices are passed on. Among students who disclosed their ethnicity in an earlier study (Scharff et al., 2014 as cited in Scharff, 2015), only 8% were from a Black or ethnic minority background. In a later study, Scharff produced findings to suggest that middle-class privilege was a concept largely unacknowledged by participants of classical music education in the same way that white-privilege was not reflected upon either (Scharff, 2017). In their 2020 strategy to tackle inequalities in education access, the Royal College of Music (RCM) acknowledged that they were below the benchmark for ethnic minority intake. Their report attributed this to a lack of specialist music tuition in State schools. They also cited a lack of exposure and aspiration for classical music in low-income areas and ethnic minority schools and proposed outreach initiatives by the RCM Sparks team to these neighbourhoods. Attempts to encourage more classical music involvement in low-income areas has been met with some criticism by scholars such as Anna Bull (2016). Bull claims that British Sistema-inspired programs in the UK should be read as 'moral projects' in the form of a middle-class civilizing mission. She claims these programs enforce middle-class culture on communities putting it at the top of

a hierarchical ideology via classical music and hence discrediting the cultural practices of the working class and other cultures. Other research on the intersections of class and race explain that working-class parents of children in inner-city areas are less able to be involved in their children's education due to long working hours and time-restraints (Ascher, 1988). Whist some research asserts the importance of parents as a mediating factor between pupils and instrumental teachers, highlighting the influence they can have on lesson participation and practice (Pitts, 2012) it is also noted that parental influence on musical development is a developing area of music education research (McPherson, 2009). Young (2016) suggests that a variety of intersecting components influence early music development and education including sociocultural factors.

Musical Identity & Musical Behaviour

The UK research available seems to support the idea that a 'cultural norm of whiteness in western music education' (Bradley, 2007, p 143) could place BAME music students at a disadvantage. The literature appears to show that the musical identity and behaviour of BAME music students could be affected by a forcing out into an outgroup position by both a 'national superiority' in music education (Westerlund et al., 2017) and the under-representation of their faces, culture and musical tastes, which assert the message 'you don't belong'. Macdonald et al. (2017) state that music can profoundly impact the development of our sense of identity. Music is connected to the development of our personal and social identities in a multitude of ways (Macdonald et al., 2002). Research suggests this includes expressing and affirming to ourselves and others culturally established values and developing or reinforcing social identity via the kind of behaviour, dress, social interactions and knowledge and skill music encourages and allows us to show

others. Taking these factors into consideration poses important questions about how a white, middle-class music curriculum might affect the musical identities of BAME working-class students. The 'other' group-status posed by a normalizing of whiteness in music education could put BAME students at risk of stereotype threat, which research has shown can directly affect career aspirations (Casad & Bryant, 2016). Implicit attitudes and stereotyping have also been shown to effect self-esteem and self-concept (Greenwald et al., 2002). However, other research, (Awad, 2007) produced findings to show that components of racial identity did not have any associations with self-esteem and academic self-concept. Certainly, figures for BAME students' entry to higher education in music show poor numbers (Scharff, 2015; RCM, 2020). Music education cultural norms are said by Bradley (2007) to affect both the musical identity and the musical behaviour of BAME students. She explains this is via a response of adapting self and conforming to the norms or else withdrawing from music altogether. Du Bois (1903) referenced a need for another identity for black people in his seminary work entitled, The Souls of Black Folk. He termed 'double-consciousness' as the concept that black people must have two fields of vision at all times. This referred to a need for awareness of not only how they viewed themselves but how the world views them (Cook, 2017).

Barriers to Tackling Racism in Music Education

Aside from the aforementioned challenges for open and critical discourse about racism and the lack of black voices in positions to do so, some researchers have suggested that the concept of protected spaces pose a barrier to change. Research from the likes of Bull (2019; 2020) and Bates (2019) suggests it is in the interest of those at the top of society's hierarchy that white, middle-class values are passed on through catalysts such as

the Arts. White and Johnson (1976) some 45 years ago addressed the issue of 'profound deficiency programs' for black youths which put the cause of low educational attainment on these youths and their families and proposed to socialize them to the preferred norms by encouraging behaviour consistent with Euro-American families. Not only did this research highlight the myth of meritocracy which CRT academics say ignores the disadvantages faced by working-class people of colour (Zamudio et al., 2010) it points to a secondary agenda behind education, interested in reproducing middle-class privilege. Gillborn (2005) claims that "although race inequity may not be a planned and a deliberate goal of education policy neither is it accidental" (p 485).

Conducting Research on Race

Modern and robust psychological research has to take into account the ever-changing and increasingly diverse society in which we live. In recognition with this, the American Psychological Association (APA) produced some multicultural guidelines for research in 2017. These were designed to take an ecological approach to research and practice and multiculturalism, taking into consideration matters of context, identity and intersectionality (APA, 2017). The APA multicultural guidelines (2017) assert in guideline number five, that psychologists should take into account historical context and hardship and its role in contributing to institutional barriers, which could include systemic racism. They are in a sense acknowledging that these experiences have shaped the identities and attitudes of those who have come into contact with such oppression and are passed on through generations. Guideline one ascertains that matters of intersectionality should also be addressed in this field of study.

Moving Towards Solutions for Social Justice in Music Education

Social justice educators propose that a starting point for solutions to racial inequalities in music education is to begin open discourse on the subject (Bradley, 2007). There is a call for music educators to evaluate their part and that of the institutions they work in, in upholding systemic racism. The desire is to see more dialogue with students, educators, universities and musicians about race and racism in music education. Warwick (2020) claims that University Music degrees are not seen as relevant or accessible to Black aspiring musicians and exampled many black musicians who are accomplished despite choosing subjects other than music for their university education. Research also suggests inclusion in the music classroom could be enabled by the implementation of practices, content and cultural influences that reflect the learners. Alexander at al. (2015) produced a report including research and perspectives from several UK academics on the subject of race and higher education. In response to the report, in the foreword, MP David Lammy made a call for an expansion in 'the kind of skills and knowledge that universities value' (p. 3). It could be argued that using this concept in music-training could make a tangible difference to BME music students and allow them to show skills other than those associated with classical and middle-class culture. Hess (2019) recommends a moving away from notation and large ensembles and a greater presence of skills more typically associated with Black music. She examples improvisation, oral tradition, and movement. A recent government report (Roberts & Bolton, 2020) made certain recommendations for black pupils in education, this included changes to the National Curriculum, increasing representation of BAME teachers, 'strong and clear anti-racist policies (p 4) and a tackling of the normalisation of police-presence in some schools. Better representation of BAME teachers is important as research has shown that not only are the

learning outcomes of BAME students positively affected by teachers of colour, but all students benefit (White et al., 2020). BAME teachers see themselves as important role-models for BAME students and mitigators of stereo-type threat (Haque& Elliot, 2017), however, despite agreeing that a diverse teacher workforce is of benefit to BAME students if they are well-prepared and offer high-quality education, Villegas and Irvine (2010) reported that the assertion that ethnically diverse teachers act as role models for BAME students, is an underdeveloped model.

This year the government released guidelines for music, targeted at specific key stages for the first time since 2007 in a new model music curriculum for England (DfE, 2021). Some encouraging updates include regular music education at Primary school level and a recommendation to abandon carousel rotation of Arts subjects to provide weekly lessons. Ensemble work has been encouraged to be part of lesson time and not just limited to extra-curricular activities and some whole class instrument learning has also been recommended. Other more formal aspects of music education are upheld with a greater emphasis on staff notation. Repertoire still draws from classical music but also includes popular and world music, with an attempt to include more female and BAME composers and musicians, though still using somewhat outdated examples (Aswad & Whitney Houston). No doubt these recommendations are a step forward for diversity and inclusion in the music classroom, whether they constitute Social Justice and an anti-racist stance is debateable. Phelps et al. (2000) carried out research on unconscious evaluations of race using fMRI technology. Amygdala and behavioural responses showed that individual experience modifies social evaluations. Whilst research in neuroscience such as this substantiates that repeated exposure to positive experiences can affect our behaviour, we

can be hopeful that a move toward more representation of BAME people in the new model music curriculum, might go some way to help change implicit attitudes and remove the invisible barriers that a cultural norm or whiteness may well have established. Finally, the literature suggests that the music industry has its part to play in addressing racial inequalities in music, as do various other institutions who Dei (2000) claims should use antiracism as a discursive framework to challenge the reproduction of inequalities they could be complicit with.

The Present Study

With little knowledge of the experiences of BAME music students or music professionals in the UK, it is difficult to predict whether any of the above propositions are on point or how effective they might be. The purpose of this study is to carry out exploratory research on BAME music professionals who were schooled in the UK and current students of the music curriculum to find out about their experiences with music education in this country. Justification for this research is based on the fact that there is no existing research on race and music education in the UK with reference to the effects of the multi-faceted lack of non-white representation, on the aspirations and career paths of BAME students. There is also a gap in UK academia to hear from people of colour, participants (George, Duran & Norris, 2013) and researchers (Pilkington, 2013), about issues that affect BAME people and music education is no exception. A useful reminder before carrying out this research as a member of the BAME community myself, came in the form of guideline two of the APA's multicultural guidelines for research (APA, 2017), which emphasised that psychologists must recognise that "as cultural beings, they hold attitudes and beliefs that can influence their perceptions of and interactions with others as well as their clinical and empirical conceptualizations" (APA, 2017, p 4). Whilst this guidance suggests I need to be

aware of my own positioning and attitudes within this research, I hope with careful managing, being a part of the BAME community as well as a music professional will be a helpful advantage for conducting this research. The research question is; **Exploring the effect of a largely white, middle-class music curriculum on the musical behaviour and identity of BAME students, music teachers and music artists.**

METHOD

Participants

The 21 participants in the study comprised a purposive sample, 11 adults and ten children. Participants were recruited according to two types of purposive sampling (Given, 2008); criterion sampling, whereby all participants were of black or ethnic minority background and adults were professional musicians or music teachers in the UK, and maximum variation sampling, with adult participants chosen for their involvement in a wide range of different musical genres. Adult participants included five music teachers (one participant dropped out) and six musicians/singers/Artists, with an even distribution of male and females. The children were secondary school students with a mixed level of engagement with music in school and comprised 5 males and 5 females.

To get a varied picture of experiences, the Musicians/Singers interviewed (including some of the music teachers who were professional musicians before they became teachers), specialised in a wide range of the following musical genres; **Jazz, Musical Theatre, Classical, Pop/RnB/Mainstream, Gospel, Independent/Singer-Songwriter, Grime/Rap**. All musicians/singers interviewed were professional and music teachers interviewed taught in UK secondary schools including state and private schools in various positions ranging from peripatetic teacher, to music specialist and heads of music department.

Pupils were from a Church of England Secondary for Boys in London (Focus group 1) and a Co-educational independent school in the Midlands (Focus group 2), though the majority of the children interviewed from Focus group 2 were attending their school on bursaries.

Demographics. Of the 11 Adults, 10 were Black Caribbean or Black African and 1 Chinese/Malaysian. Students were mixed ethnicity including Black African or Black Caribbean, Armenian, Indian and Mixed race British White & Indian. Adults' age ranged from 31 – 42 years with a mean age of 38 years. Children were aged 12 – 14 years with a mean age of 13.5 years.

Table 1.1

Adult participant details

Teacher (T) or Musician/Singer (M)	Pseudonym	Sex	Age	Ethnicity	Main Genre
M	Musician1	M	35	Black Caribbean & White British	Classical
M	Musician2	M	38	Black African	Mainstream/Pop
M	Musician3	M	31	Black African	Grime/Rap
M	Musician4	F	39	Black African & Caribbean	Singer-Songwriter
M	Musician5	F	42	Black Caribbean	Mainstream
M	Musician6	F	38	Black Caribbean	Musical Theatre
T	Teacher1	F	41	Black Caribbean	Gospel
T	Teacher2	F	40	Black Caribbean	Musical Theatre
T	Teacher3	M	37	Black Caribbean	Jazz/Mainstream
T	Teacher4	M	37	Black Caribbean	Steel Band
T	Teacher5	M	40	Chinese/Malaysian	Mainstream/Pop

Table 1.2

Student participant details

Focus Group 1 or 2	Pseudonym	Sex	Age	Ethnicity
1	Student1	M	13	Armenian
1	Student2	M	14	Mixed British White & Indian
1	Student3	M	12	Sri Lankan
1	Student4	M	12	Black African
2	Student5	M	14	Black African
2	Student6	F	14	Black Caribbean
2	Student7	F	14	Black African & Caribbean
2	Student8	F	14	Indian
2	Student9	F	14	Indian
2	Student10	F	14	Black African & Caribbean

Tools

Participants were asked to submit their postcodes at 13 years so that their social class when growing up could be determined by the researcher. The following online algorithm was used to establish class by postcode for the children interviewed https://imd-by-postcode.opendatacommunities.org/imd/2019 This referenced their postcode with the IMD (Index of Multiple Deprivation) rank on the English Indices of Deprivation (2019a), newest available version. The IMD is the official measure of relative deprivation for small areas in England, ranked from most deprived area (a score of 1) to least deprived area (score of 32,844). For example: Neighbourhood X is ranked 5,000 out of 32,844 neighbourhoods in England, where 1 is the most deprived, consequently, Neighbourhood X is in the 15% most deprived area of England. The English Indices of Deprivation Frequently Asked Questions (2019b) states, "It is common to describe how relatively deprived a neighbourhood is by saying whether it falls among the most deprived 10 per cent, 20 per cent or 30 per cent of small areas in England (although there is no definitive cut-off at which an area is described as 'deprived')" (p. 10). For this study, children were considered working class if their postcode showed they lived within the 30% most deprived areas of England, as indicated by the IMD rank scores for 2019. A score above 30% would be considered middle class for the purpose of this study.

Class for adults was also determined by looking at the IMD rank score on the year 2000 report of the Indices of Deprivation, which was the earliest version available. This was necessary to look at the districts as they were when our music teachers and artists were growing up. In the 2000 report a rank of 1 indicated most deprived and 8414 least deprived. This report had to be sourced from the National Archives

(https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100407204456/http://www.communities.gov.uk/archived/general-content/communities/indicesofdeprivation/indicesofdeprivation/)

Data were collected using semi-structured in-depth interviews with the adults (Smith, Flowers, & Larkin, 2009) and two focus group style informal interviews/discussions with the school students: see full interview schedules in appendix A and B. Focus groups were chosen as a preferred method of data collection with the young people as a group context has been shown to encourage free-flowing speech, minimized intervention from the researcher and a less intense environment to share views compared with a one-to-one context (Barbor & Kitzinger, 1999). The interviews lasted between one and two hours. The focus groups were one hour in duration. All data collection was carried out remotely via google meet video calls due to COVID social-distancing restrictions and only the audio was recorded using otter.ai recording and transcribing software.

Procedure

Participants were contacted via email based on prior acquaintance, a mutual contact or Facebook music educator forums. A participant information sheet detailed the nature of the study and what would be involved. An example of the type of questions that would be asked was provided for carers of the school pupils as they were all under the age of 18 years, though it was requested that students not see the questions prior to the interviews so as not to influence or create premeditated answers. Anonymity was assured for all participants and written consent requested from all participating adults and the parents and carers of students. Once consent was given, interview appointments were set up via email correspondence at a mutually convenient time and a secure link to a private 'google meet'

session was set up by the researcher. A pilot study was initially conducted with one professional singer to test the interview schedule and get acquainted with good interview techniques and expose any necessary changes to either. No modifications were made following this interview and answers from the pilot interview were included in the final data set.

The focus groups were kept to a maximum of 6 students per group as it is recommended that participant numbers are not too large when working with young people to manage activity and allow all children to participate (Gibson, 2007). Ground rules were given at the start of the focus group sessions such as raising a hand to speak to prevent participants from talking over each other (Gibson, 2007) and this also helped with the fact that students were in different rooms from each other on the google meet. The set-up involved students on two to three separate devices to ensure appropriate social distancing and a teacher or nominated member of staff on another device to act as chaperone. Safeguarding participants in the pupil focus groups was a priority. An ethical framework when working with children in focus groups, like any research, is regarded essential (Gibson, 2007). A teacher or school representative was present on the google meet at all times to assist should any students become stressed by intense group discussion, as can happen (Goodman & Evans, 2006 as cited in Gibson, 2007) and the researcher had detailed conversations with the school Head of music about the research to make sure that all participating students understood the terms and the nature of disclosure and confidentiality.

Musicians and Singers are referred to collectively as 'Musicians' in the findings. All participants names were removed or changed in the final data set to protect anonymity, however, some of the adult musician participants expressed a keenness to advertise their

involvement in the study for the purpose of including it on their own social media campaigns and branding but also because they were keen to show their public support for racial equity in the music industry. Participants were given the opportunity to request to see the results of the completed study and also review their own interview transcripts and data analysis prior to completion. This was done in order to enhance the data collection credibility but also to give participants a sense of control over the information they had shared in the interviews with an option to review and change any parts they felt necessary. The study was approved by the music department ethical committee at the University of Sheffield.

Data analysis

The verbatim interview transcripts were subjected to Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis (Smith & Osborn, 2003). An idiographic approach to analysis was taken as recommended by Smith (2015) where one interview transcript at a time was looked at in detail, examining each individual experience before moving on to the next. It was not until much later in the process that general claims were developed. Consequently, an individual table of themes was produced for each participant or focus group, then a further table of themes grouping together overlapping themes from the three categories of participants, *teachers, musicians* and *students* to illuminate similar or shared experiences across their accounts and finally a master table of themes was constructed bringing together the main themes from the entire data set. The first two stages of analysis were a lengthy process, which involved in accordance with the IPA framework, examining not only explicit descriptive experiences from participants but applying the interpretative part of the analysis, where the researcher looks for implicit meanings and attaches their own

interpretations. Once the final stage of analysis was reached and master themes were identified, to check accuracy and credibility, the original individual transcripts were again referred back to as well as presenting the emerging themes and process of analysis to an independent supervisor during the process.

FINDINGS

The research question asked whether a predominantly white, middle-class music curriculum has an effect on the musical behaviours and identity of BAME people in the UK. Findings from this study suggest that people from a BAME background, experience considerable barriers in music education and musical careers. The data shows that these barriers affect musical behaviour and identity and additionally have adverse psychological effects on this population. Black culture and community was reported in the data as a source of resilience for BAME individuals who grew up in the UK, providing a source of agency for success in life and music. Other means of agency for adult participants were supportive teachers or mentors who took a special interest in them and being given a chance or opportunities by various sources of help with regards to music. These sources of agency were sometimes considered more useful aspects of music career progression than formal music education. Agency for current UK students of music were shown to be the existence and quality of primary school music education and participation in private instrument lessons. Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) was applied to the data to produce these findings which are summarised in Table 2. The three superordinate themes which emerged from the data can be described as, '*Barriers*' experienced by BAME people in music education and musical careers, '*Psychological effects'* on BAME people as a result and *'Agency'*, which refers to the alternative means that have been used by BAME people to advance in music education and careers, as well as current means of agency important for students today. Each superordinate theme has several subordinate themes which underpin and explain the main themes.

The volume and richness of data gathered was such that the researcher was forced to omit certain aspects of participants' experiences and therefore the findings discussed are those that were felt to relate most closely to the research question.

Table 2

Master Table Summarising Superordinate and Subordinate Themes

SUPERORDINATE THEMES	SUBORDINATE THEMES	SUPPORTING QUOTE FROM DATA
Barriers	Parents	'Dad would always tell us…being black kids, we always have to work twice as hard as anybody' M1
	Lack of multi-ethnic representation & diversity	'the only black people I saw at school were the cleaners' M5
	Normalizing of whiteness	'Now…we're so aware of all this kind of race stuff…I wasn't back then' M2
	Stereotyping	'That comment about can you be more Black, sometimes is code for can you add more sass' T2
Psychological Effects	A sense of not belonging or fitting in	'I always felt just a little bit… invisible' M5
	Multiple identities	'I'm always having to…remind myself that it's fine to be myself' M3
	Stereotype threat	'Never just think that's all they can do' T1
	Low self-belief	'I always feel like I am just not enough in the room' M4
	Stress and Mental strain	'I think…there's been so much struggle in a lot of black people's lives' M5
Agency	<u>Adults/former students:</u>	
	Black culture	'Maybe it's because you move in those circles and black people move in those circles' M5
	Supportive teacher or mentor	'I had an incredible music teacher…always super encouraging' M1

	Opportunities and being given a chance	'It's opportunity that has very much got me to where I am' M2
	<u>Current students:</u> Instrument lessons	'In school it's like a limited amount of time, you only have a music lesson like once a week…It's kind of limited to what you can…learn' S2
	Primary school music education	'in primary school up to like year three, I played the recorder, then I did the clarinet from year four to six. I played the piano in that time as well' S4

The findings from the study will now be illustrated using the superordinate themes and subordinate themes, verbatim extracts from the interviews and focus groups and will be discussed alongside existing literature and psychological theory.

Notes: Where '...' is shown within a quote it is an indication of missing words. Abbreviations used for quotations are as follows, T1 = Teacher 1, M1 = Musician 1 and S1 = Student 1 etc.

Barriers Experienced by Black and Ethnic Minority People in Music Education and Musical Careers

Parents

The data highlighted multiple barriers for BAME people in music education and subsequently musical careers, which started very early on in life and close to home. These barriers highlighted an intersection of class and race and a world for children that was influenced by them being the sons and daughters of first-generation immigrants. The attitudes and beliefs of immigrant parents, notably Black Caribbean and African, were shown to have an opposing dual effect on their children's relationship with music. This displayed as, both a steering away from music education at GCSE level and above and

musical career aspirations, but which also provided them with the characteristics and resilience to succeed in music. The former mentioned barrier will be discussed here, and the agency of parents discussed in the last superordinate theme.

All of the parents of adult participants had immigrated from African or Caribbean countries, with the exception of one. A number of parents were part of the Windrush generation and most African parents also arrived in England in the 1960s-70s from countries such as Ghana and Nigeria. Parents were described as hopeful for a life of better prospects, instead parents were described as receiving an unexpected hostile reception in England and encountered a hard life of lower paid jobs, long hours and experiences of prejudice and racism. Teacher 2 comments on how her father's struggles were behind the strictness she often felt from him and the strong desire he had for her to do well academically,

> …particularly for my dad... he is one of the smartest people I know, but never got the opportunity to shine. He's from a tiny island where, you know, he left for this country to come to the UK on his 17th birthday... when he got to a country that didn't want him, he was treated very differently…And he always wanted us to aim higher and be a bit more aspirational, he didn't always communicate that that well, because it just came out in just like just standard Dominican 'telling off'.

These experiences appeared to have a profound effect on parents, 'I'm very sure that our parents,[and] our grandparents, just dealt with a lot of trauma' (M6) and how they parented, preparing their children to expect racial discrimination 'we were purposely given names which were quite English sounding or not black sounding' (T4).

Their struggle caused them to encourage children towards stable professions, in the hope that they would do better than they did with a desire to protect them, if possible, from some of the hardships they encountered. This definitely did not include the precarity and frivolity of the music business, as Teacher 2 explains, ‘even though they knew I was good at it, it was, when I first brought up the subject of doing like performing arts for A-level that was like, 'absolutely not!' - because you need to go and be a doctor!’.

Several parents’ views on music acted as a direct barrier to music education, ‘If there was anything I could change about my formal [music] education I would have, if my mum had allowed me to, I would have studied everything!’ (M5) whilst other parents were not able to be involved with nurturing formal music development because of their socioeconomic situations. Musician 2 recalls,

> They weren't ever massively fussed about like coming to shows and all that because they were always working hard...they got work in the morning and all the rest of it so, they weren't necessarily like how I am with my children now

Participants did not show hostility to their parents for these attitudes, because they understood, especially now as adults, where it stemmed from because they were ‘just always in survival mode’, (M3).

Previous research reflects these findings. Mcpherson (2009) notes that parenting goals affect parenting styles and practices which contribute to children’s musical identities,

attitude and involvement in music. The sociocultural environment was also acknowledged as having an effect on children's musical development. Research from Ascher (1988) also supports the idea that children from inner city and urban areas can be put at a disadvantage with regards to education due to a trend of a lack of parental involvement. Ascher reports that this is due to poverty, long-working hours and time restraints, which make parents less available for their children. Supporting Bates' (2019) research on class and race intersectionality, this study also reported that adult participants were from a largely working-class background, with two of them growing up in the 1% most deprived areas of England and another in the 10% most deprived area of England. The remaining participants who were considered working class grew up within the 30% most deprived areas of England. See Table F1 and F2 in appendices for participant social class details and information on the procedure used for establishing class of participants. This study supports previous research that suggests that sociocultural issues are involved in musical development (Young, 2016) and points to the importance of not looking at the education system in isolation in this field of study.

This study highlights the effect of historic and systemic racism on the generations that followed, understanding that these parental styles and beliefs were in some part shaped by their experiences of racial discrimination. As well as having an effect on individuals in this study, data suggested that these experiences and attitudes may have material outcomes for BAME people in the music industry.

> The reason you don't have any black MDs is because all their parents made them go and be doctors and lawyers, even though they could play Grade 8 piano (T2)

Parents of student participants showed similar negative attitudes to music, 'my dad was like, she's not gonna need it in her later years, there's no point whereas you could be taking something else [for GCSE]' (S8). However, data analysis showed this was more connected with a general attitude towards the Arts in comparison with core subjects as opposed to a response to racial discrimination. APA (2017) multicultural guidelines for research highlight the importance of historic contexts for studies on race and ethnicity, this appeared to be particularly significant in this study. Findings related to this subordinate theme also support previous research which suggests that parents are key influencers on musical development (Mcpherson, 2009; Pitts, 2012).

Lack of Multi-Ethnic Representation & Diversity in Music Education and the Music Industry

Data from the teachers' experiences identified various issues related to race representation in the music curriculum. Notably a lack of diversity with regards to representation of BAME people and a 'heavy-weighting toward western classical music'(T5). Explanation for this was based around tradition and a conveyor belt of ideals coming from the top. Some argued that this was a cycle which perpetuated a lack of change.

> A lot of the other music teachers, that's what they know, it's what they've studied, and it's what they're familiar teaching but also a lot of people who end up writing the textbooks and writing the exams and all that are the products of that particular conveyor belt of education so it's understandable in a way. But of course, it's a vicious cycle. If you.. don't teach kids about that in school, then the music teachers from the new generations are not going to know about it and won't be able to teach it (T5)

Bradley et al. (2007) recognised this cycle in their research in the US and expressed a concern for the next generation of music teachers who they say are being trained to perpetuate a lack of diversity in music education. Teachers reflected on a lack of diversity and representation in the music industry that made it harder to give positive examples to students, Musician 1 states, 'classical music has been the last of the arts to really understand and take up what diversity is…it hasn't infiltrated classical music because we're still perpetuating these things and calling them tradition'. When representation was attempted in the curriculum teachers identified it as more of an effort at multiculturalism than breaking down racial barriers & often came across as tokenism and a monolithic and stereotypical view of black music.

> In terms of then anything cultural, it was African drumming, which even now as a teacher I'm looking at it like, it's a bit embarrassing, you know, it's like just saying 'black music', I mean, what, what is that? You know, it's so vast (T1).

Extensive research in the literature by Bradley (2006; 2007) claims that multiculturalism in music education is often a token gesture for diversity and inclusion and proves to be an ineffective strategy for addressing race inequalities or holding music of other cultures with the merit they warrant. Students were also aware of the lack of diverse representation and prolificacy of classical music in the curriculum today,

> [I do not see] much connection because like my grandparents and stuff, they're very into like Eastern music, like Indian music and stuff like that and it's never, I've never actually like heard of it or [seen it] reflected it in like a lesson at all. The only kind of

> topics we've ever done are just general classical music and then more African style (S2).

Student participants also appeared to make a connection between classical music and 'white culture'. Comments such as 'the songs and the things that we're taught are very much white' (S6), were made. Adult participants reflected on how a lack of representation in their music education shaped their aspirations and self-efficacy later on in life and the difference they think more diversity would have made to them, 'If you don't see people that look like you doing something, it doesn't cross your mind that you can do it' (T5). In a sobering story, Musician 1 recalls watching The Proms three nights in a row as an eight-year-old child, after which questioning his mother whether he should be playing the oboe, explaining, 'because I haven't seen any black people doing it in the orchestras'. As illustrated in that story, the lack of representation in the music education system appeared to be mirroring the music industry and support for this came across in the data from the musician participants. Numerous participants explained that it was a normal occurrence to be the only black person in the room in their work environments or 'the only black person in the whole tour' (M5). Musician 2 explained how this extended beyond on-stage,

> Most of the time in my career, I've been the only black guy in the room. And I'm not talking in the band, I mean the whole room, so, lights, sound, band, make-up, hair, wardrobe, runners, stage-crew, even the stagehands that come in

Whilst being in the minority is not an example of racism in itself, research substantiates that it can nonetheless have a negative effect on wellbeing (Branscombe et al., 1999) and participants express how it made them feel uncomfortable, 'there have been some

situations in very white settings where I felt very awkward and uncomfortable' (T3). The repetitive occurrence of situations like this seem to affirm the ideology of normalized whiteness.

Normalising of whiteness

As the data began to paint a picture of favoured representation of classical music and lack of representation of other genres, or ethnic diversity, it became apparent that a predominantly white and middle-class canon is being projected through the UK music curriculum and with it a normalising of these ideals. Student participants in particular were starkly unaware that this might be a problem or unfair, with one professing, 'you do need to learn about the classical music, we can't just change the entire curriculum for *coloured people' (S7) (* see appendix J). Even adult participants used phrases that suggested an acceptance of the dominance of Eurocentric ideals when they were at school and a normalising of whiteness, for example, 'that's not their fault, it's just how it was' (T3), and 'as a child you just do what the teacher tells you so, you don't think am I being represented or underrepresented' (T4). Many reflected on only becoming aware of lack of representation in music education and the normalising of it, when they were much older. 'I never felt like it wasn't a level playing field until I finished school' (M3). This finding placed alongside the apathy surrounding race representation in the student participants, 'in a way it doesn't matter' (S2), suggests that change is not going to be student-led. Past generations may need to stand in the gap for this generation who might be ill-prepared for racial discrimination due to being further removed from the overt acts of racism their grandparents experienced and more oblivious to its occurrence and effects.

Data from this study showed a normalising of whiteness in all areas of the music industry, even surrounding black music, when the wider workforce was taken into consideration. A trend of a lack of BAME people in what many termed 'gate-keeper' roles was also apparent in the data. Many participants seemed to express that gate-keeping was not only damaging because it limited the opportunities and careers for BAME people, but when it was exercised in black music settings they felt devalued and exploited, 'it's like they want our sound but not us' (T2). Musician 6 worked in a major West End musical centred around a black story and commented on the fact that it was 'a whole black show written by a black woman, about a black woman, and the only black people who are involved in it are the cast!'. Evidence suggests that a lack of change is probable without BAME in senior and casting roles, and this also potentially puts the industry at a disadvantage by not understanding culturally diverse experiences.

Findings related to this subordinate theme are strongly supported in previous research, which suggests that there is a 'cultural norm of whiteness' in music education (Bradley, 2007; Bates, 2019) and the wider context of education (Hyland, 2005). Similar to Gillborn (2005) experiences from participants of this study suggest a subtlety to racial inequalities, which are reported to be more damaging than overt acts of racism (Gillborn, 2005). Closed access to gate-keeper roles for BAME people also resonates with the 'protected spaces' referred to in research that suggests that a hierarchical system exists whereby the upper and middle classes at the top look after their own interests and pass on their privilege to those who have the same cultural values (Bull, 2016;2019; Gillborn, 2005).

Stereotyping

Further data analysis showed that stereotyping limited BAME people's music roles and opportunities and kept some spaces normalised as white by protecting them from an ethnically diverse presence.

> I confuse people and that was one of the things that came out of my doing my Musical Theatre diploma, they don't understand people like me, I'm not the right type of black for them… I've been given notes before to 'be more black'...and I'm like.. what does that mean?

A lack of representation does not only exist at an artist or industry level but also in the music classroom in terms of teachers. 'All my [music] teachers were white' was a sentiment paraphrased by every adult participant in this study. In fact, this was the case for all participants in the study, excluding the four focus group students who had been recruited via one of the black music teachers also being interviewed for this study. Similarly, these four commented that this was their first and only black music teacher. However, in line with existing research (Rhodes, 2017; HM Government, 2020) Teacher 2 explains how there is a disparity between ethnic diversity in pupils and teachers in today's schools, 'until I came along, or at the particular school that I'm working with at the minute, I'm the only person of colour in the faculty, but they've got so many kids in that school who are not white'.

An assessment from the data analysis suggests that a lack of representation, normalising of whiteness and stereotyping both within music education and the music industry present potentially the biggest barriers to the BAME community due to their subtle nature as

opposed to overt examples of racism that are generally less tolerated, mirroring findings by Gillborn (2005). Disavowing of racial barriers were often followed by descriptions of being 'the only black person in the orchestra' or describing incidents that today would be termed as clear microaggressions, such as when one participant was dissuaded from playing a woodwind instrument because his lips were apparently too big. This normalising of inequality was described by Scharff (2018) with regards to the participants in her study and gender when she reports on the many ways musicians "negotiate the exclusions that characterise the classical music profession" (p 85).

Subtle messages, stereotyping and a normalising of whiteness are all factors which lead the researcher of this study to believe that there is in fact not less racism in music education for today's pupils', they are simply more accepting of it and further unaware of what it could mean for them. Whilst there are arguments to keep race issues out of the classroom and of late ban Critical Race Theory being taught or talked about in schools (Sawchuk, 2021), perhaps it is time for students to be made more aware. Research suggests we are comfortable with talking about 'culturally relevant teaching', but does that go so far as talking about racism and taking an anti-racist stance as Bradley (2007) calls for? Ignoring racial differences and adopting 'colour-blindness' are not deemed the way forward to help lead discourse on issues of race in education and are in fact considered more damaging (Morrison, 1992: Landsman, 2001; Hyland, 2005; Glazier, 2003). Findings from this data provoke speculation about the consequences of the current UK music curriculum on the next generation who appear unfamiliar with the complex web of factors; layered systemic racism, prejudiced attitudes, unintentional bias and a normalizing of whiteness accepted by both white and ethnically diverse people. These factors in no small way contribute to

systemic racism and indeed give explanation as to why it is so difficult to quantify, such as was seen with the recent Government Sewell report on Race in the UK (The Report of the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities, 2021), which claimed to find no evidence of systemic racism in the UK. Indeed, it is hard to qualify 'a feeling', though many who have been through the UK music education system feel sure enough to say, 'I just know the pathway for me if I had white skin would just be different' (M2).

Psychological Effects on Black and Ethnic Minority People as a Result of Barriers They Experience in Music Education and the Music Industry

Data analysis highlighted that numerous psychological effects were experienced by musicians and teachers as ethnic minorities throughout their education and careers. These were often interrelated in nature and appeared to be associated with the multiple barriers BAME people are presented with in music education and the music industry, as discussed in the first superordinate theme.

A Sense of not Belonging and not Fitting In

A sense of not belonging or fitting into their musical environments, at some point in their life due to race, was expressed by all musician participants and most teachers. 'I've always been aware I'm a black person in classical music' (M1), 'I know I'm not going to fit into one world' (M3). Findings also highlighted how this had an adverse psychological effect on participants, 'so I think psychologically there is that feeling of 'oh ok, there is no space for me' (M4).

The lack of representation of BAME people as documented in the first superordinate theme, caused participants to feel they weren't welcome in many areas they worked in, and a sense that whilst their talents and contributions were utilised and valued to some extent, they themselves as people were not. A repeated message, paraphrased in different ways by numerous participants, was summed up by Musician 5 'I just think that people often want 'our sound' and they don't want us'. The lack of acceptance and belonging was described by one participant as a 'battle that you're fighting through in your head' (M4). Self-Determination Theory (Deci & Ryan, 2000) emphasises a need for relatedness and belonging to others as a basic psychological need and a key part of human motivation, a lack which can have an impact on success and education as well as wellbeing.

Multiple Identities

In the same way, many experiences of negative perceptions led to multiple identities being adopted by some. Typically, this involved acting in a way that was expected of them, rather than being their whole authentic self.

> I didn't used to have this accent, I mean I used to have quite a thick accent…moving, going to music college…I brushed it over to articulate, to fit into this, what I saw at the time as an 18-year-old, very middle-class profession (M1)

Others commented, 'I used to dumb myself down a lot to get on' (T2). Musicians too relayed experiences that suggested a need for multiple identities, 'I do feel like I'm always having to figure out my identity' (M3) and the effect this had on them, 'I don't feel like 100% me and I'm censoring myself in different situations and that has a psychological effect on

me' (M3). One teacher referred to this as 'playing the game' and how he had been taught the rules of 'the game' via his parents, again born out of their experiences of racism.

Stereotypes and Stereotype threat

It became clear through the data that participants' multiple identities were not always self-appointed with the purpose of fitting in. Other identities were often imposed on BAME musicians via stereotypes. This was apparent early on in school music education as well as in musical career experiences. Musician 6 recalls, 'I absolutely fell in love with classical music, but was pushed into jazz'. Teacher 2 spoke about how young black boys can be at risk of stereotype threat in schools when they are restricted by what is expected of them.

> You're encouraged to like other things that aren't classical music with classical music still being seen as being very white. So again, that's not for you...But this other stuff, you go ahead and do that, go and do drill music, that's for you, but then we're going to hate on that as well. We're going to pour scorn on that music…it's very interesting

Making a similar assessment, Teacher 1 concludes,

> I think if we empower our kids to be themselves, not to feel they have to emulate a certain stereotype…I think they'll achieve so much more than we'd ever even think, more than they would think of and, you know, this whole cultural diversity will just blow up

This powerful statement suggests that a release from conforming to stereotypes and enforced multiple identities could be pivotal in driving forward diversity and inclusion. The

Teachers are right to show concern for the effects stereotyping might have on the futures of their students as research substantiates that stereotype threat can have a negative effect on career aspirations (Casad & Bryant, 2016). Referral to a glass-ceiling effect was frequent as participants made reference to invisible barriers and a stunting that left them despondent and lacking belief in themselves and the industry.

Low Self-Belief

A lack of self-belief was strongly reported in music teachers, who despite being competent in multiple instruments, having completed numerous graded music examinations and received music scholarships, doubted themselves to the point that many did not opt to engage in further music education. Teacher 1 explained, 'I didn't think my theory was up to scratch' and Teacher 2 simply said, 'I didn't think I was good enough'. Findings from this study also show that a lack of representation and seeing others succeed in formal education, affected participants' self-belief, 'I think if I had known that [there were musicians, composers, teachers of BAME background] growing up, my mindset about what I am capable of would be different' (T1).

A dominance of White representation and negative messages about identity and belonging appeared to compound a lack of self-belief and contribute to low self-esteem in musicians too, who held equally impressive accolades. This group included MOBO award winners, sold-out stadium tours and being part of some of the most renowned orchestras in the world as part of their resumes. Musician 1 also states 'Still even now I get huge amounts of imposter syndrome…I just didn't think I was good enough'. The second Mode of Influencing in Bandura's (1990) model of Self-Efficacy, Social Modelling, also explains how seeing people

who are like yourself achieving goals increases self-efficacy. In the same way it can be argued that a lack of representation can contribute to the low self-efficacy reported amongst musicians.

Stress & Mental strain

These multiple psychological factors were shown to place considerable stress and strain on participants, which only became obvious to some once their health was seriously impacted.

> I actually had like a physical, not breakdown, but like I was physically ill, and when the doctors came to my house [in an] ambulance, they had no explanation for it and they said, it looks like it's, I can't remember what they called it... but it was like um something to do with stress or whatever. And then I realised I don't feel stressed about anything but, I think it was just me having to be all these different people in these different rooms just started to weigh on me and not taking breaks in addition to that, wasn't helpful (M3)

Findings suggest that the sense of having to 'play the game' and 'work twice as hard for half as much' (T2), as immigrant black parents repeatedly asserted to their children, is a huge weight for BAME people in musical careers to bear alongside their usual occupational stressors. A weight that many of their white counterparts do not have to experience. A pressure to have to be the best at all times and never fail because you only get one chance was apparent in the data,

> If I'm the black one in amongst a sea of white faces and I do something out of line, I'm the one you're going to remember…I have to be a little bit better behaved sometimes (M1).

Comments were supported by a variety of experiences including being aware of bands that would not book some black musicians again due to one black person's conduct, a situation that a white person would be unlikely to experience. This was an accepted pressure by many participants, 'you have to do everything that you can do to show that you're still the best person despite your race' (T4), 'you just get on with life because I guess you start to normalize this stuff, like the pressure' (M2).

Adult musicians, particularly in high-profile positions, felt a pressure to prove themselves not just for employers and their parents but on behalf of their entire demographic. Again, this displays a pressure unique to BAME people in music and was typified in an experience recalled by Musician 2,

> It's funny because one time that I really remember where it really came to the fore, was when I was actually doing [a famous UK band] tour…I was essentially going to be the only black guy in the band. I'll never forget the nervous energy before the first show. 90,000 people at Croke Park, I mean it's loud as heck, and everybody's nervous, like everybody, I mean, people are pacing up and down, it's like this history-breaking gig and we're about to do the first show, and, like, as long as I live, I'll never forget that 10/15 minutes before going on stage. But the reason I tell this story is because the weight of 'my' nerves is a little bit different. I was nervous because I knew that if I effed it up, I felt like I was effing it up for a whole demographic, and I knew all these

> young black keyboard players and musicians were watching me because I'm the black guy that managed to get on that platform. He's the only black guy in the band again. So, if I screw up, I'm screwing up for everybody and that's legit what was going through my head.

This example shows how a lack of black representation in the music industry puts a huge pressure on those who have a platform to be role models, whether they desire it or not. Previous literature evidences an additional 'hidden workload' for BAME people based around navigating racial inequalities (Tereshchenko et al., 2020). It would seem that if more allies could share the burden, together with a normality for diversity, some unnecessary pressure felt by BAME people might be alleviated.

The data from this study suggests that simultaneous with the normalizing of whiteness is a normalizing of psychological pressure and trauma amongst the BAME population working in music. Disavowing prejudice as a result of a normalizing of inequality was described by Scharff (2018) with regards to the participants in her study and gender when she reports on the many ways in which musicians "negotiate the exclusions that characterise the classical music profession" (p 85). In this way it could be suggested that participants used acceptance as a coping mechanism. Branscombe et al. (1999) proposed a model which tested the effects of attributions to prejudice on well-being in African Americans. Results suggested that willingness to make attributions to prejudice can have a direct negative effect on wellbeing in both a personal and collective sense, as a minority group perceives they are rejected by a majority group. This study supports these assumptions and other psychological theories such as Social Identity Theory (Tajfel & Turner, 1986) and Self-

Determination theory (Deci & Ryan, 1985) which emphasise the importance of a feeling of belonging for wellbeing. However, in the face of a resistance to change and a silence from the sectors they work in as well as people outside of their own communities, BAME people with careers in music have been forced to live with 'the way things are'.

Students interviewed seemed very unaware of any personal racial barriers and spoke about them very much in the sense of 'other people' or 'some people might feel'. The normalizing of whiteness discussed within the first Superordinate theme explained some of the lack of awareness that today's youths have surrounding race. No psychological effects of race issues were apparent, thankfully, in the student data, however, it was believed important to include this superordinate theme considering the implications for current and future students. Additionally, there is no data on the mental health of the BAME population who work in music careers, pointing to a gap in the research.

Whilst Branscombe et al.'s (1999) model suggested that willingness to make attributions to prejudice can have a direct negative effect on wellbeing, they also explained that the model had a bidirectional process of a simultaneous indirect positive effect on personal and collective wellbeing. This was as minority group identification was enhanced via rejection from the majority group. This notion is supported in the next superordinate theme, Agency.

Sources that Provide a Sense of Agency for Black and Ethnic Minority People to Progress in Music Education and Musical Careers

Participants pointed to sources of agency that contributed to boosting a belief in their own ability to progress in music and additionally provided them with musical skills. This supports psychological theory on personal agency that suggests it is influenced

by self-efficacy as well as actual skill (Bandura, 1990). Adult participants highlighted different sources of personal agency to pupils, potentially pointing to a changing cultural climate.

Black Culture

An unexpected finding in this study was how much Black Culture provided a sense of agency for BAME individuals' progression in music education and musical careers. Adult participants referred to multiple factors present in the microsystem of BAME children, according to Bronfenbrenner's (1979) social ecological system. The researcher termed this microsystem in the context of this study, 'Black Culture'. Components include church which is a big part of black culture (Byfield, 2008) and neighbourhoods and local community, all of which involved family. Bronfenbrenner describes the microsystem as the most intimate and influential of the five levels within the ecological systems theory. The interaction a child has with components of the microsystem provides a learning setting and reference point for the world (Swick & Williams, 2006). Paat (2013) says that having an understanding of the microsystems involved in the lives of immigrant children can help draw insights on the factors that shape them and their interactions with social systems.

Church was a prominent feature of many of the adult participants' backgrounds and upbringing. Music is a big part of the black Pentecostal church experience. Many described the church as an informal musical training ground which offered their first and most comprehensive music learning. 'I think I learned to harmonise definitely in church, I learned to sing in the car with my mum when she played Shirley Caesar' (M5)

> Playing in church, just flowing, during the worship becomes a part of your DNA, so essentially you're making up songs on the spot, just putting chords together and all that kind of stuff (M2)

This informal music learning often used and taught informal techniques such as improvisation and playing by ear, which were not to be found in the music curriculum but were often admired by teachers and music colleagues. One participant remembers being asked to play improvised music on the piano as students arrived for the school assembly in place of an absent teacher, a skill he learned playing in church. Adult participants recalled receiving comments such as 'oh my gosh...how do you guys play by ear? like [you] church musicians? (M2) and were often unaware that they had skills that were coveted by formally trained musicians,

> I didn't realize that they looked at me the same way [I looked at them] and thought I was amazing and so clever, because I could hear things without seeing them written down' (M5)

Black culture was a key part of the musician participants' childhood and early music development in particular. Community gatherings and home-life that heavily involved music, all nurtured a love and appreciation for music.

> I think it was unintentionally encouraged because it was such a huge part of family gatherings. Ghanaian Hall parties were like a huge thing when I was growing up… it was like, you know, one big family. (M3)

Supportive individuals in the wider community as well as church, were mentioned often as will be discussed more in the next subordinate theme. Support for the church community being a source of empowerment to black people can be found in the literature. Byfield (2008) claims that the church offers black people a cultural and social capital that helps them to succeed. Byfield studied the effect of the church on the academic success of US and UK black students finding that the church is "a place for skills development and nurturing" (p 195) which provides positive Black role models within the congregation who build esteem and aspiration in younger members.

Parents were very much part of this positive force and whilst they were seen as barriers to musical careers, they ironically appeared to help both fuel a passion for music and instil the hard-working ethic into participants that helped them to overcome adversity and succeed in musical careers. It is almost as if where black students could not access the affirmation, encouragement and training they needed from the education system, they received it in abundance from their own community. Like Branscombe et al. (1999) suggested, receiving an in-direct positive effect from minority group identification in the face of majority group rejection. A real sense comes through the data that rather than feeling victims, and pushed down, in spite of doubts and wounded self-belief, black people are proud of who they are and what they can do. The data from this study suggests that pride in blackness is part of black resilience and a key factor in black achievement, supporting Byfield's (2008) research.

> So yeah of course people probably do see me as a black musician, but you know, I wear black with a capital B, it's part of who I am. I own that blackness, so I'm very happy for people to identify me as a black musician and a good black musician (M1)

Supportive Teacher or Mentor

Many participants reported that a supportive mentor or music teacher/teacher, acted as a significant person in their development by championing them and 'going the extra mile' for them with regards to their education and music development. In school this was usually a white person, outside of school it tended to be someone who was black. This 'someone' believing in them was immensely powerful in terms of encouraging them to have belief in themselves and giving them the direction and confidence to take steps towards the next part of their musical journeys.

> I had some really influential teachers, who pushed me to go in that direction, where my own faith in my own ability lacked, they made up for it (M1)

> My actual GCSE music teacher took me under her wing, quite literally, after-school rehearsals, she contacted my mum, and mentored me. Said 'you can play, you can do this, this is how you do it', and really taught me the way I needed to be taught, which I understand now, as a teacher (T1)

These findings suggest that allies who are willing to stand in the gap and take an invested interest in BAME students are important. The strong enabling influence of educators on the choices of students is also highlighted here. Some attributed the most significant help in their musical careers to supportive teachers or mentors, 'I think it's just having people who've had faith in me along the way, has been the best support that you can have' (M1).

Opportunities and Being Given a Chance

A helping hand was instrumental in the music development and career progression of BAME musicians and teachers. Aside from the encouragement of mentors and teachers, tangible opportunities such as music scholarships and gifted & talented schemes, as well as significant performance opportunities and job offers, were instrumental in the developing musical lives of participants. Many felt these instances were key in getting them to where they are now in terms of success. For some musicians, opportunities and being given a chance were a substitute for formal music education and therefore deemed more significant than schooling.

> Despite everything, I know that it's opportunity that has very much got me to where I am…The opportunities literally are what has made me like think this is something I could do (M2)

> It [performance opportunity] just gave me a glimpse into the future and I thought I could do this. So, I kept on recording and putting out music and I got nominated for a MOBO award (M3)

However, school music engagement and opportunities were also reported to play a significant role,

> So, when I look back at my school days I realise, for as much as we didn't have the all-sorted curriculum, what I was given was opportunity and that plays a massive

> part in your journey. Sometimes, the biggest thing that someone can do is not tell you what to do or anything like that, just give you an opportunity. (M2)

These findings show that scholarships and programs in addition to individuals and organisations who can seek 'opportunities that I wouldn't know where to look for' (M1) have made a significant difference in the lives of many BAME musicians' lives and supports the importance of providing them for this population.

Private Instrument Lessons

Helpful factors for the BAME student participants proved to be a high level of music engagement both in school and out, facilitated by parents. Many mention music being encouraged at home and some had instruments at home. Parents funded private instrument lessons for many of the students. Based on the criteria used for establishing social class in this study (see appendix F), students were mostly considered middle-class compared with the adult participants who were mostly considered working-class at the same age. Some children had tried up to five different instruments by the time they reached Year nine.

> In primary school up to like year three, I played the recorder, then I did the clarinet from year four to six. I played the piano in that time as well, and at secondary school I learned piano, and I've been doing ukulele in class (S4)

Experiencing multiple instruments helped them to explore their preferences and gauge their interest in music as a subject. Many lessons were subsidised in primary school but required

fee payment at secondary school level. Private instrument lessons whether in school or outside of school were considered a helpful head-start in music at secondary school level.

> It's pretty difficult to get full marks if you haven't had instrument lessons, unless you're extremely gifted or very industrious and have taught yourself the right way. Pretty much when we get to Year 9 and they start thinking about doing GCSE music, we say to them look, you really need to be doing instrument lessons (T5)

Primary School Music Education

Data from the teacher participants also revealed that early music engagement through a variety of means such as private lessons and extra-curricular musical activities such as bands and orchestras were helpful factors in their own music education as well as that of the students they teach. Both teacher and student participants expressed that the presence and quality of music education at primary school level was a clear advantage for better outcomes in secondary school music and conversely a major disadvantage when absent. Teacher 5 notes, 'my experience has been that they come to year seven and we basically start from scratch with them'. Without a decent head-start in music via primary school and with the absence of private instrument lessons, it was generally believed to be extremely difficult to succeed in GCSE music.

> It's not I didn't really enjoy it, it's because I didn't really know how to do note reading and stuff like that so, that's really the main reason why I didn't pick GCSE music (S6)

The new model for the music curriculum (DfE, 2021) released earlier this year shows some encouraging progression towards addressing some of the difficulties highlighted by students

in this study such as a lack of good quality primary school music education. However, the importance of access to instrument lessons and parents who are available and willing to facilitate music engagement is highlighted in findings from this study with evidence in previous literature suggesting this can be difficult for BAME children due to socioeconomic factors (Ascher, 1988; Young, 2016).

Recommendations Based on the Findings

More Black and Ethnically Diverse Music Teachers. In response to the research question, while Teacher 4 does not agree the music curriculum today is too white and middle-class, he states 'there is definitely room for improvement'. This study puts forward a compelling argument for more black and ethnically diverse teachers in music education, supported through data provided by all three participant groups, Students, Musicians and Teachers.

> To have a teacher who is of colour, who is black, who can really connect with students for specific topics, which are actually very powerful, is important (T3)

Black teachers are aware they can connect and talk to BAME students 'in a way that my white counterparts can't' (T2) and generally believed that access to such teachers in their childhood, no matter how limited, had a positive impact on them and their music education.

> I know from growing up, if there was a black teacher, black music teacher or musician or any kind of experience, I was like, you know, Meerkat! - like.. tell me more, I wanna learn, because I could identify with that person, you know. (T1)

Students too expressed that if there were more ethnically mixed teachers, they would bring something extra to music education and have more awareness of the minority students in the classroom,

> I think the main reason why there's not enough representation in class, is because there's no one to represent it for us. Like many of our teachers are…mainly white so, if they're the ones that are helping build the curriculum…they wouldn't necessarily think, 'oh yeah, let's think of the two people in our class that are Black or Asian (S6)

Greater Diversity in the Content and Teaching Practices Within the Music

Curriculum. Diversity and accessibility in the syllabus is called for, beyond representation, however involving a wider inclusion of multi-ethnic composers and musicians but also incorporating more diverse genres of music with less dominance of the classical sector. The inclusion of informal teaching practices such as improvisation and lyric writing were also encouraged by participants.

High-Quality, Subsidised Music Lessons. However, findings did not report a desire to abandon formal education practices and many adult participants expressed a wish to have learned an instrument or how to read music in their childhood had they had better access. Subsidised lessons are important to address the intersections of class and race apparent in the data from this study. 'I definitely wish I learned to play an instrument…I just think there weren't enough free opportunities, and it wasn't packaged in a right way' (M3).

Music Industry Recommendations. Findings from this study suggest that the music industry has a key role to play in improving various race issues that not only affect the lives of BAME people with musical careers but also filter down into music education. This

includes improving representation of BAME people in a diverse range of roles, with particular emphasis on senior and 'gate-keeper' positions. Challenging stereotyping of Black music genres and individuals and valuing them, as well as their contributions to music are also emphasised.

The message is clear, that representation matters, diversity matters, and we will not have an inclusive music curriculum without it. Ignoring race issues in music education is not the way forward and many black academics have attested to how ineffectual a colour-blind attitude is (Morrison, 1992). BAME people in this study expressed the desire to have the freedom to bring their whole selves into the room, their colour, their culture, their backgrounds, their true self. This was considered important for themselves and future generations of BAME people with implications beyond music education and careers, but also pertaining to their mental health. There may not be a more powerful and empowering statement to finish this report with than the words of Musician 1, if only everyone could have the freedom to feel like this,

> I'm going to come into the space and I'm going to bring my Blackness with me, and you are going to acknowledge it, because it's a part of who I am. It's a part that for so long, I've not necessarily been ashamed of but, we kind of, we just don't talk about it...So, I mean I don't care what anybody else thinks, I bring my Blackness, I own my Blackness and I'll bring it with me.

CONCLUSION

To summarise, the findings from this study indicate that BAME people experience extensive barriers to music education and music careers.

- Historic racism in the UK to the parents of second-generation immigrants has affected parenting attitudes consequently resulting in them being discouraged from education and careers in music.
- BAME students do not see themselves reflected in the teachers, content or teaching practices of the UK music curriculum. Lack of representation and diversity in music education affected past students' aspirations for taking music at GCSE or further education level in addition to pursuing careers in music
- A normalising of whiteness in music education and many sectors of the music industry, notably classical and musical theatre, but also pop and mainstream, has perpetuated the existing barriers to people of a BAME background.
- The lack of representation in music education and the music industry perpetuates stereotypes about BAME people in music and puts children at risk of stereotype threat

Findings also show that the extensive barriers experienced by BAME people in music education and the music industry come with adverse psychological effects, many of which only become apparent in adulthood. This includes a feeling of not belonging or fitting in, a need to adopt multiple identities, stereotype threat, low self-belief and stress and mental strain. A sense of agency with regards to music learning and progressing in musical careers was provided by Black community and cultural practices (Black Culture), namely, church,

family and the wider community. Supportive mentors or teachers as well as opportunities and helping hands were other positive forces in the music education and career progressions of Black people and ethnic minority people. Students indicated that engaging in private instrument lessons and good music education at primary school level were means of agency for taking GCSE music.

Implications

By looking at 3 categories of BAME participants, this study was able to paint a good overview of music education both from a teacher and pupil perspective. Utilising a biographical method enabled the researcher to examine the journey of 11 BAME individuals from their early experiences within the UK music education system right up to their present professional careers. This allowed for a rich, historic, ethnographic perspective of the BAME experience in music education and music careers. Also enabling associations to be made between them. Whilst the barriers experienced by Black people evidenced in this study have not prevented these participants from prevailing in musical careers, findings suggest that potentially many others have not and will not. More notably, this study suggests that success has often been gained via considerable struggle and at great psychological cost. The focus groups with 10 pupils currently engaged in music education in UK schools offered a current perspective and comparison with adults' experiences, which allows for reflection on possible trajectories. Whilst adults' biographical accounts show a contributing effect of the state of western music education on how they engaged in music, their career aspirations, psychological flexibility and musical identity, the researcher suggests that there is the potential for students of today to experience the same. This supposition is made with

particular consideration of the fact that the students in this study reported similar experiences of a lack of representation and diversity in their current music education.

Limitations, Further Study and Personal Reflection

The student focus groups consisted of more 'middle-class' participants than the adult participants according to the criteria for defining social class used in this study. Focus group 1 which contained students living in West London, in particular appeared to contain children from a more privileged background. The majority of students in Focus group 1 were of West and South Asian-decent. They were also all boys. It became clear during the Focus groups that educational views and outcomes and cultural practices were very different between different ethnic groups. Whilst I hope some of these issues were balanced with the second focus group of girls from the Midlands, which contained more Black children and a wider mix of social class, nonetheless these challenges highlighted the number of compounding factors this type of research is faced with. The variety within the spectrum of cultures under the term Black and Minority Ethnic (BAME) is of issue when trying to examine issues faced by people of colour. All adults interviewed for this study, apart from one, were Black. Since 15 of the 21 participants in this study were Black African or Caribbean, this study focuses much more on the Black experience within 'BAME'. Further study focused on other ethnically diverse experiences within music education is recommended as well as research specific to inner-city working-class students today. This study also suggests that there are considerable psychological and mental health issues for BAME musicians and music professionals, yet to date there is no published research in this field. This highlights a pressing need for further research to explore incidence, prevalence and solutions for mental health in the black community within music.

Problems with Defining Social Class

All six teachers in this study were categorised as middle-class and five out six of the musician participants were from a working-class background. These five were shown to be living in the 10% most deprived areas of England at 13 years of age according to the English Indices of Deprivation (See appendix F for criteria for defining social class). However, using this criterion, when deprivation scores were cross-referenced with extent scores, some small areas within the wards previously lived in by adult participants showed discrepancies, which took participants below the 30% deprivation threshold, which had determined them middle-class. Other class ambiguities were apparent as one participant was displayed as living in a middle-class area yet was only able to receive a music education with a scholarship, whilst another, also calculated as middle-class by postcode, had grown up in Care. Presumably the postcode could have been from foster carers. These discrepancies highlight a weakness in research tools used and the possibility that social class categorisations are inaccurate.

Personal Reflection

I am aware that carrying out this research as a Black mixed-race woman could have implications on impartiality and colours the subjectivity of this study. At the same time research suggests a reluctance for white academics to address issues of race (Landsman, 2006) and at the same time a scarcity of BAME academics exists (Alexander at al., 2015). These facts together why awareness of my own and many of my colleagues experiences with music as a BAME person, propelled me forward with this research. Whilst I mostly feel that my insights and personal experiences as a black music professional

benefited my understanding and interactions with the data set, I was aware that it could warrant an emotional response. Some participant stories were difficult to hear and triggered memories of my own personal experiences of racial discrimination. Keeping a reflexive diary was helpful as an emotional outlet, for processing my thoughts and feelings and in trying to keep them outside of the data analysis.

Final word

As Glazier (2003) asserts "authentic conversation, and conversation about race in particular, is challenging" (p 88), nonetheless it is a necessary part of meaningful change. This study highlights a need to 'do the work' despite the difficulties, from individuals to institutions. In addition, importance is shown for the need of 'the work' not only to be propelled by the BAME community, who have taken up the cause and been adaptive in the face of the historic and present barriers yet have felt the mental fatigue and psychological distress in doing so. Much of the work has been done by Black communities, in much a similar way as the Pan-African schools of the 70s and 80s did in response to failures, picking up the slack where the education system failed their children. Allies are required.

Secondly, I believe this study highlights that the level of racism and racial disadvantage in music education, wider education and UK society, cannot simply be measured by outcomes. We might well be able to find Black musicians in certain elevated roles, or even look at the vastly talented and successful sample of participants in this study and claim that racism and racial disadvantage does not exist. However, until we listen to and understand the experiences of the BAME population in music careers, we cannot announce that there is

no racism, systemic or otherwise in the UK. The success of the individuals examined in this study has been obtained through much struggle, navigating many barriers and at great psychological cost and unfortunately the music curriculum set-up appears to be a contributing factor.

Diversity equals inclusion. 'We need to teach all the things to all the people' (T1). There is joint responsibility for change here, as diversity needs to also be present in the music industry in order to filter down into music education. Of course, it would be naïve to not also acknowledge that industry changes, without top-down changes in the education system, will have little influence. Equally without evaluation, challenge and change in wider British society with regards to the complex norms and traditions that overlook, sometimes quite unaware, how much whiteness there is in our multicultural United Kingdom, things will remain the way they are, as Bradley (2007) declared, "perpetuating racism by leaving whiteness the undisturbed and undisputed cultural norm" (p 143). I share her fears that if this is the case "our concerns about social justice [in music education] will amount to little more than lip service" (p 143).

References

Adams, R. (2020). Fewer than 1% of university professors are Black. *The Guardian.*

https://www.theguardian.com/education/2020/feb/27/fewer-than-1-of-ukuniversity-professors-are-black-figures-show

Alexander, C. E., Arday, J., & Runnymede Trust. (2015). *Aiming higher: Race, inequality and diversity in the academy*.

American Psychological Association. 2017. Multicultural Guidelines: An Ecological Approach to Context, Identity, and Intersectionality. Retrieved from: https://www.apa.org/about/policy/multicultural-guidelines.pdf

Ascher, C. (1988). Improving the school-home connection for poor and minority urban students. *The Urban Review*, *20*(2), 109–123. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01112512

Awad, G. H. (2007). The Role of Racial Identity, Academic Self-Concept, and Self-Esteem in the Prediction of Academic Outcomes for African American Students. *Journal of Black Psychology*, *33*(2), 188–207. https://doi.org/10.1177/0095798407299513

Bandura, A. (1990). Perceived self-efficacy in the exercise of personal agency. *Journal of applied sport psychology*, *2*(2), 128-163.

Barbor, R.S., & Kitzinger, J. (1999). Developing focus group research. *Politics, theory and Practice*.

Bates, V. C. B., & Weber State University (USA). (2019). Standing at the Intersection of Race and Class in Music Education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *18*(1), 117–160. https://doi.org/10.22176/act18.1.117

Bradley, D. (2006). Music education, multiculturalism and anti-racism: Can we talk. *Action, criticism, and theory for music education*, *5*(2), 2-30.

Bradley, D. (2007). The sounds of silence: Talking race in music education. *Action, criticism, and theory for music education*, *6*(4), 132-162.

Bradley, D., Golner, R., & Hanson, S. (2007). Unlearning Whiteness, rethinking race issues in graduate music education. *Music Education Research*, *9*(2), 293–304. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800701384516

Branscombe, N. R., Schmitt, M. T., & Harvey, R. D. (1999). Perceiving pervasive discrimination among African Americans: Implications for group identification and well-being. *Journal of personality and social psychology*, *77*(1), 135.

Bull, A. (2016). El Sistema as a bourgeois social project: Class, gender, and Victorian

values. *Action, criticism and theory for music education*, *15*(1), 120-153.

Bull, A. (2019). *Class, Control, and Classical Music*. Oxford University Press USA - OSO. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/sheffield/detail.action?docID=5778929

Casad, B. J., & Bryant, W. J. (2016). Addressing Stereotype Threat is Critical to Diversity and Inclusion in Organizational Psychology. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *7*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2016.00008

Charles, E. (2019). Decolonizing the curriculum. *Insights*, *32*(1), 24. https://doi.org/10.1629/uksg.475

Clark, Caroline, & Medina, Carmen. (2000). How Reading and Writing Literacy Narratives Affect Preservice Teachers' Understandings of Literacy, Pedagogy, and Multiculturalism. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *51*(1), 63–76. https://doi.org/10.1177/002248710005100107

Cook, N. (2017). The Imaginary African: race, identity, and Samuel Coleridge-Taylor. *Handbook of musical identities, 703 – 721.*

Cvencek, Dario, Nasir, Na'ilah S, O'Connor, Kathleen, Wischnia, Sarah, & Meltzoff, Andrew N. (2015). The Development of Math-Race Stereotypes: "They Say Chinese People Are the Best at Math". *Journal of Research on Adolescence, 25*(4), 630-637.

Deci, E. L., & Ryan, R. M. (2000). Self-Determination Theory and the Facilitation of Intrinsic Motivation, Social Development, and Well-being. *American Psychologist*, 55(1), 68–78.

Deci, E. L., & Ryan, R. M. (2008). Facilitating optimal motivation and psychological well-being across life's domains. Canadian Psychology, 49, 14–23.

Dei, G. S. 2000. *Power, knowledge and anti-racism education*, Halifax: Nova Scotia,

Fernwood Publishing. [Google Scholar]

Delgado, R., Stefancic, J., & Harris, A. (2017). *Critical Race Theory (Third Edition): An Introduction*. New York University Press. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/sheffield/detail.action?docID=4714300

Department for Education. (2021). Guidance for teaching music in schools. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/teaching-music-in-schools

Drummond, J. (2010). Re-thinking Western Art Music: A perspective shift for music educators. *International Journal of Music Education*, *28*(2), 117–126. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761410362854

English Indices of Deprivation. (2000). https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100407204456/http://www.communities.gov.uk/archived/general-content/communities/indicesofdeprivation/indicesofdeprivation/

English Indices of Deprivation. (2019a). https://imd-by-postcode.opendatacommunities.org/imd/2019

English Indices of Deprivation. (2019b). *Frequently Asked Questions.* https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/853811/IoD2019_FAQ_v4.pdf

Elpus, K. (2015). Music Teacher Licensure Candidates in the United States: A Demographic Profile and Analysis of Licensure Examination Scores. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *63*(3), 314–335. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022429415602470

George, S., Duran, N., & Norris, K. (2013). A Systematic Review of Barriers and Facilitators to Minority Research Participation Among African Americans, Latinos, Asian Americans, and Pacific Islanders. *American Journal of Public Health*, *104*(2), e16–e31. https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2013.301706

Gibson, F. (2007). Conducting focus groups with children and young people: Strategies for success. *Journal of Research in Nursing*, *12*(5), 473–483. https://doi.org/10.1177/1744987107079791

Gillborn*, D. (2005). Education policy as an act of white supremacy: Whiteness, critical race theory and education reform. *Journal of Education Policy*, *20*(4), 485–505. https://doi.org/10.1080/02680930500132346

Given, L. M. (2008). *The Sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods [electronic resource]*. SAGE.

Glazier, J. A. (2003). Moving closer to speaking the unspeakable: White teachers talking about race. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, *30*(1), 73. http://www.proquest.com/docview/222854413/abstract/2AE90CC204934D9DPQ/1

Greenwald, A. G., Banaji, M. R., Rudman, L. A., Farnham, S. D., Nosek, B. A., & Mellott, D. S. (2002). A unified theory of implicit attitudes, stereotypes, self-esteem, and self-concept. *Psychological review*, *109*(1), 3.

Haque, Z., & Elliot, S. (2017). Visible and Invisible Barriers: the impact of racism on BME teachers. *London: National Union of Teachers.* https://neu.org.uk/media/2936/view

Hess, J. (2017). Equity and Music Education: Euphemisms, Terminal Naivety, and Whiteness. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *16*(3), 15–47. https://doi.org/10.22176/act16.3.15

Hess, J. (2018). Troubling Whiteness: Music education and the "messiness" of equity work. *International Journal of Music Education*, *36*(2), 128–144. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761417703781

Hess, J. (2019). *Music education for social change: Constructing an activist music education*. Routledge.

HM Government. Department for Education. (2020). *Ethnicity Facts and Figures. School Teacher Workforce.* https://www.ethnicity-facts-figures.service.gov.uk/workforce-and-business/workforce-diversity/school-teacher-workforce/latest

Hyland, N. E. (2005). Being a Good Teacher of Black Students? White Teachers and Unintentional Racism. *Curriculum Inquiry*, *35*(4), 429–459. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-873X.2005.00336.x

Johnson, P. (2015). The visible minority: Nowhere to be Seen in the Academy. In Alexander, C. E., Arday, J. (Ed.), *Aiming higher: Race, inequality and diversity in the academy*. (pp 13-14). London: Runnymede Trust.

Justiz, M. J., & Kameen, M. C. (1988). Increasing the Representation of Minorities in the Teaching Profession. *Peabody Journal of Education*, *66*(1), 91–100.

Landsman, J., & Lewis, C. W. (2006). *White Teachers, Diverse Classrooms: A Guide to Building Inclusive Schools, Promoting High Expectations, and Eliminating Racism*. Stylus Publishing, LLC.

Landsman, J. (2009). *A White Teacher Talks about Race*. R&L Education.

MacDonald, R. A. R., Hargreaves, D. J., & Miell, D. (2002). *Musical Identities*. Oxford University Press.

MacDonald, R., Hargreaves, D. J., & Miell, D. (2017). *Handbook of Musical Identities*. Oxford University Press.

Mcpherson, G. E. (2009). The role of parents in children's musical development. Psychology of Music, 37(1), 91–110. Https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735607086049. *Psychology of Music*, *37*(1), 91–110. https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735607086049

Morrison (1992). *Playing in the dark : whiteness and the literary imagination* (1st Vintage Books ed.). Vintage Books.

Nwanoku, C. (2019, July 26). *Classical music is overwhelmingly white and male. My orchestra shows that can change.* The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/jul/26/classical-music-white-male-orchestra-proms-female-bme-chineke

Paat, Y.-F. (2013). Working with Immigrant Children and Their Families: An Application of Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment*, *23*(8), 954–966. https://doi.org/10.1080/10911359.2013.800007

Phelps, E. A., O'Connor, K. J., Cunningham, W. A., Funayama, E. S., Gatenby, J. C., Gore, J. C., & Banaji, M. R. (2000). Performance on indirect measures of race evaluation predicts amygdala activation. *Journal of cognitive neuroscience*, *12*(5), 729-738.

Pilkington, A. (2013). 'The interacting dynamics of institutional racism in higher education'. *Race, Ethnicity and Education* 16(2): 225−245.

Pitts, S. (2012). *Chances and Choices: Exploring the Impact of Music Education*. Oxford University Press, Incorporated. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/sheffield/detail.action?docID=4704805

Rhodes, D. (2017, July 12). *Schools need 68,000 extra BME teachers to reflect Population.* BBC News. https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-40568987

Roberts, N., & Bolton, P. (2020). House of Commons Library: Briefing Paper Number 09023, 8 October 2020: Educational outcomes of Black pupils and students. https://commonslibrary.parliament.uk/research-briefings/cbp-9023/

Ross, A. (2020, September 14). *Black scholars confront white supremacy in classical music.* The New Yorker. https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2020/09/21/black-scholars-confront-white-supremacy-in-classical-music

Royal College of Music. (2020). Access, Disabilities and Equal Opportunities.

https://www.rcm.ac.uk/about/governance/strategy/accessdisabilitiesandequaloppo rtunities/RoyalCollegeofMusic_APP_2019-2020_V1_10007778.pdf

Sawchuk, S. (2021) *Education Week*
https://www.edweek.org/leadership/what-is-critical-race-theory-and-why-is-it-under-attack/2021/05

Scharff, C. (2015). Equality and diversity in the classical music profession. *London: King's College London* . https://www.impulse-music.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Equality-and-Diversity-in-Classical-Music-Report.pdf

Scharff, C. (2017). *Gender, Subjectivity, and Cultural Work: The Classical Music Profession*. Routledge.

Scharff, C. (2018). *Gender, subjectivity and cultural work: Classical music profession*. Routledge.http://www.vlebooks.com/vleweb/product/openreader?id=USheffield&isbn=9781315673080

Smith, J. A., & Osborn, M. (2003). Interpretative phenomenological analysis. In J. A. Smith (Ed.), *Qualitative psychology: A practical guide to research methods* (pp. 51–80). Sage Publications, Inc.

Smith, J. A. (2015). *Qualitative psychology: A practical guide to research methods*. Sage Publications, Inc.

Smith, J. A., Flowers, P., Larking, M. (2009). Interpretive phenomenological analysis: Theory, method and research. London, UK: SAGE.

Swick, K. J., & Williams, R. D. (2006). An analysis of Bronfenbrenner's bio-ecological perspective for early childhood educators: Implications for working with families experiencing stress. *Early childhood education journal*, *33*(5), 371-378.

Tereshchenko, A., Mills, M., and Bradbury, A. (2020). Making progress? Employment and retention of BAME teachers in England. London: UCL Institute of Education.

The report of the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities. (2021). GOV.UK. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/the-report-of-the-commission-on-race-and-ethnic-disparities

Villegas, A. M., & Irvine, J. J. (2010). Diversifying the teaching force: An examination of major arguments. *The Urban Review*, *42*(3), 175-192.

Warwick, J. (2020). *Music education has a race problem, and universities must address it*. The Conversation. Retrieved 12 January 2021, from http://theconversation.com/music-education-has-a-race-problem-and-universities-must-address-it-143719

Westerlund, H., Partti, H., Karlsen, S., & Karlsen, S. (2017). *In R. MacDonald, D. J. Hargreaves & D. Miell (Eds.) Handbook of Musical Identities* (pp. 493–509). Oxford University Press.

White, J. L., & Johnson, J. A. (1976). Awareness, Pride and Identity: A Positive Educational Strategy for Black Youth. *Journal of Black Psychology*, *2*(2), 32–42. https://doi.org/10.1177/009579847600200207

White, T., Woodward, B., Graham, D., Milner, H. R., & Howard, T. C. (2020). Education Policy and Black Teachers: Perspectives on Race, Policy, and Teacher Diversity. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *71*(4), 449–463. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487119879895

Young, S. (2016). Early childhood music education research: An overview. *Research Studies*

in Music Education, *38*(1), 9–21. (n.d.).

Zamudio, Margaret, et al. *Critical Race Theory Matters : Education and Ideology*, Taylor & Francis Group, 2010. *ProQuest Ebook Central*, http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/sheffield/detail.action?docID=592906.

APPENDICES

Appendix A

Teacher and Musicians Interview Schedule

Key words: Behaviour, Identity, Race, Class

Adult Questions (Teachers/Artists)

1. Can you tell me a bit about where you grew up, your family background and about the schools you attended?

2. What would you say were your earliest influences musically (people & experiences)? Was music encouraged at home?

3. What kind of musical involvement, if any did you have at school?

4. Can you describe how you found school music education to be? (Prompts – think about the content, teachers, delivery, opportunities)

5. Did you have any private music tuition either in school or out and can you tell me about it? (Prompts as above) – If not for what reasons?

    - Do you play an instrument/read music?
    - What were the main ways you acquired your music skills?

6. How well do you feel your musical tastes, culture and demographic were represented and reflected in the formal music education you received? (Were you in any way, positively or negatively aware of race within your music education?)

7. What kind of musical engagement did you have outside of school? (How congruent was outside of school musical activity with your school music education?)

8. What were the biggest helps in your musical engagement growing up? – and hindrances?

9. When, how and why did music become a career choice? (How much influence did your school music education have in that choice?)

10. What factors have helped you along the most in your musical career? Did you experience any barriers to a career in music as a person of colour?

11. As a BME person in music, do you get a sense of where your place is, overtly or covertly?

12. Do you believe you are seen first as a musician or first as a black musician? (Do you ever find yourself acting differently or feel it necessary to represent yourself differently with regards to your personal sense of identity and your musical identity?)

13. What if anything would you change about your school music education to help with your career? As a BME person, what would you want music educators, curriculum writers and policy makers to be aware of?

Appendix B

Student Interview Questions

1. Can you tell me a bit about where you grew up, your family background and about the schools you attended?

2. What/who are your biggest musical influences, that could be people or experiences? Is music encouraged by your family? How is music a part of your life/what importance?

3. What kind of musical involvement if any, have you had at school?

4. How do you find school music education to be? (Prompts – think about the content, teachers, delivery, opportunities)

5. Tell me about your out of school musical activity? Any private tuition, as well as informal learning?

6. How similar or different and in what ways, are your in school musical experiences compared with out of school?

7. Who are your musical inspirations, role-models and idols?

8. Do you feel represented and see yourself reflected in your formal music education at school? (Think about your tastes, culture, demographic and appearance) (Prompt – are you in any way, positively or negatively aware of race within your music education?)

9. Is further study in music a consideration for you? Yes/No, Why?

10. Would you consider music as a career option? Yes/No, Why?

11. How has your school music education informed your choices for the future? What would your ideal career be? And thoughts on probable career?

12. What things, if any, would you change about music education in school?

13. Is there anything that would make you feel more represented in music education?

14. When you think of Black musicians, where do you have a sense of them belonging and not belonging? Do these ideas effect your own musical identity?

15. What would you want writers of the music curriculum and music teachers to know with regards to BME students in school? What would you want to say to them?

Appendix C

Participant Information Sheet

Title of Project: Exploring the effect of race representation in the UK music curriculum on the musical behaviour and identity of BME (Black and Minority Ethnic) students, music teachers and music artists.

Name of Researcher: Natasha Hendry

You are being invited to take part in a research study. Before you decide whether or not to take part it is important that you understand why the research is being conducted and what it involves. Please take time to read the following information. Ask me – my email address is at the bottom of this page - if there is anything that is not clear or if you would like more information.

1. **What is the purpose of the study?**
   The objective of this research is to carry out an exploratory study into music education and race in the UK against the backdrop of the western music curriculum. This study aims to understand the experiences and perspectives of BME (Black and Minority Ethnic) music students, music professionals/artists and music teachers who received their music education in the UK. This is a research project which will be assessed and form part of my final grade for the Dissertation module in my final year at Sheffield University (post-graduate Masters student).

2. **Do I have to take part?**
   Definitely not. It is up to you to decide whether or not to take part. If you do you will be asked to give consent by signing a consent form. You are still free to withdraw at any time and without giving a reason – simply let me know that you would like to stop.

3. **What will happen to me, and to my data, if I take part?**
   You will be interviewed about your personal and musical experiences; the whole interview will take around an hour. If there is any question that you would like to miss out, that is fine, we can move onto the next question or stop altogether.
   It is important that you are aware that this whole interview will be audio recorded. Interviews will be conducted via Zoom but only the audio recording will be saved, video (visual) will be discarded as soon as the interview is over. It will then be transcribed (typed up) and analysed. You have the right to see this transcript, so please let me know if you would like to do so. Please also ask me if you would like to know more about the process of analysis involved.

4. **Are there any risks or benefits involved?**
   Talking about race issues can be triggering for some people who may have had or know of difficult experiences. If you believe for any reason that this topic may be too upsetting for you, then please do not participate. If you think you just do not have the time, or are not interested, then please do not participate. Strictly there are no perceived benefits to your participation, although some may value the opportunity to reflect on personal experiences and voice your thoughts and opinions about a subject that not only may have affected you, but your peers as well, present and future. Race and Racism in Music Education is an under-researched topic, and your contribution would be very valuable in that respect.

5. **Will my taking part in the study be kept anonymous and confidential?**

Yes, your data will be kept secure at all times. You will be asked to suggest a pseudonym (a made-up name) to describe you in the report and your real name will not be used in the report at any time. All the information that is collected about you will be kept strictly confidential and you will not be identified or identifiable in any publication. Any data collected about you in the interview transcriptions will be stored in my Dropbox 'vault' which is password protected and designed to safely store sensitive and confidential information. Data will be kept for a maximum of 7 years should further study, by the original researcher, be warranted. Due to the nature of this research, it is possible that other researchers may find the data collected to be useful in answering future research questions, again for these reasons data will be anonymised and any identifiable personal data will be stored for a maximum of 7 years, after which it will be destroyed.

6. **Who is the data controller?**
   The University of Sheffield will act as the Data Controller for this study. This means that the University is responsible for looking after your information and using it properly.

7. **Who has ethically reviewed this project?**
   This project has been ethically approved via the University of Sheffield's Ethics Review Procedure, as administered by the Music Department at the University of Sheffield.

8. **I am under 18, do you need my parent's consent?**
   Yes, a parent or carer will need to read this form to fully understand the nature of the study and must sign the consent form along with yourself to grant permission for participation. Please also see information for parents/carers below.

9. **INFORMATION FOR PARENTS/CARERS OF UNDER 18s**
   It is important to me that your child is kept safe during this research and that you as a parent or carer are fully aware of what it will involve and are happy for them to participate. Please follow this link to see the questions I plan to ask your child in the interviews;
   https://www.dropbox.com/sh/4lisv4ck9ezox0q/AAA-CtRLlqpAOiHXRUqDJ_wQa?dl=0
   I would prefer it if the questions are not shared with your child before the interview to allow them to respond in real-time.
   If you have any queries about the questions or study, please do not hesitate to get in contact with me via the email address below. For your assurance I am also DBS checked to work with young people and vulnerable adults.

Many thanks,
Natasha Hendry

Contact Details of Researcher:
nehendry1@sheffield.ac.uk

You might also want to contact my dissertation supervisor:
Stephanie Pitts: s.e.pitts@sheffield.ac.uk

Appendix D

Participant Demographics Form

Please complete the below demographic information which will be kept anonymous and presented in the context of 'information on all participants as a group'. Skip any questions you do not wish to answer.

Sex:	
Age:	
Parents occupation:	
Postcode (at 13yrs):	
Musical accolades/achievements/artists, orchestras performed with:	
Read music:	
Play an instrument:	
Taken any musical exams:	

Appendix E

Participant Consent Form

Title of Project Exploring the effect of race representation in the UK music curriculum on the musical behaviour and identity of BME (Black and Minority Ethnic) students, music teachers and music artists.

Name of Researcher Natasha Hendry

Please read each of the following statements carefully, and tick those with which you agree. If you have ticked all of these and would like to take part, please then sign or initial below.

	Please tick to indicate that you agree. Please leave blank if you do not agree.
I have read the information sheet provided and I am happy to participate. I understand that by completing this questionnaire I am consenting to be part of the research study and for my data to be used as described.	☐
I understand and consent to my interview being audio recorded, and that I have the right to read my interview transcript.	☐
I understand that I have the right to refuse to answer any or all of the questions I am asked and may withdraw at any time.	☐
I am over 18 years of age *or* have shared the participant information with my parent or carer who has granted me permission to participate in this study by signing below.	☐

Having read and agreed to each of the statements above, I give full informed consent to my participation in this study.

Participant Name (please print clearly, or provide initials only if you prefer):

Participant Signature (or initials): **Date:**

Parent/Carer Signature (or initials): **Date:**

Researcher Name: Natasha Hendry

Researcher Signature: **Date:**

Appendix F

Procedure for Establishing Social Class of Participants

The following online algorithm was used to establish class by postcode for students https://imd-by-postcode.opendatacommunities.org/imd/2019

Social class for adults was determined by looking at the *extent score on the year 2000 report of the Indices of Deprivation, which was the earliest version available. This was necessary to look at the districts as they were when our music teachers and artists were growing up.

Findings on social class. Due to the fact that so many of the adults interviewed were from areas with low IMD rank scores, the figures were also cross referenced with the *extent score on the 2000 report. *Extent score = Proportion of a district's population living in the wards which rank within the most deprived 10% of wards in the country. The indices of Deprivation 2000 explains, "The aim of this measure is to portray how widespread high levels of deprivation are in a district. It is the proportion of a district's population living in the wards which rank within the most deprived 10% of wards in England. It only includes districts which contain wards which fall within the top ten percent of the most deprived wards in England. Therefore, some districts will not have an overall score for this measure. A rank of 158 indicates a district with no score, Scores 1 – 158" (p. 1). ? out of ? of the adults interviewed were consequently revealed to have grown up in the 10% most deprived areas of England as ranked in the year 2000.
(Notes from: Indices of Deprivation 2000: Ward indices)

*Extent score - ***Extent***
Proportion of a district's population living in the wards which rank within the most deprived 10% of wards in the country.
The aim of this measure is to portray how widespread high levels of deprivation are in a district. It is the proportion of a district's population living in the wards which rank within the most deprived 10% of wards in England. It only includes districts which contain wards which fall within the top ten percent of the most deprived wards in England. Therefore, some districts will not have an overall score for this measure. A rank of 158 indicates a district with no score. Scores 1 – 158.)

Table F1

*Teacher and Musicians Social Class cross referenced with whether they can **play an instrument, read music** and have **taken graded music exams**.*

Teacher (T) or Musician/Singer (M)	Pseudonym	Sex	Age	Ethnicity	Class	Main Genre	Play an instrument	Read Music	Taken Music exams
M	Musician1	M	35	Black Caribbean & White British	W	Classical	Y	Y	Y
M	Musician2	M	38	Black African	W	Mainstream	Y	N	Y
M	Musician3	M	31	Black African	W	Grime/Rap	N	N	N
M	Musician4	F	39	Black African & Caribbean	W	Singer-Songwriter	Y	N	N
M	Musician5	F	42	Black Caribbean	W	Mainstream	Tiny bit	N	N
M	Musician6	F	38	Black Caribbean	M	Musical Theatre	N	Tiny bit	N
T	Teacher1	F	41	Black Caribbean	M	Gospel	Y	Y	Y
T	Teacher2	F	40	Black Caribbean	M	Musical Theatre	Y	Y	Y
T	Teacher3	M	37	Black Caribbean	M	Jazz/Mainstream	Y	Y	Y
T	Teacher4	M	37	Black Caribbean	M	Steel Band	Y	Y	Y
T	Teacher5	M	40	Chinese/Malaysian	M	Mainstream	Y	Y	Y

Table F2

Students' Social Class

Focus Group 1 or 2	Pseudonym	Sex	Age	Ethnicity	Class
1	FG1_student1	M	13	Armenian	M
1	FG1_Student2	M	14	Mixed British White & Indian	M
1	FG1_Student3	M	12	Sri Lankan	M
1	FG1_Student4	M	12	Nigerian	M
2	FG2_Student5	M	14	Black African	M
2	FG2_Student6	F	14	Black Caribbean	W
2	FG2_Student7	F	14	Black African & Caribbean	W
2	FG2_Student8	F	14	Indian	M
2	FG2_Student9	F	14	Indian	W
2	FG2_Student10	F	14	Black African & Caribbean	M

*Class determined by postcode at 13yrs referenced with the English Indices of Deprivation 2000 (adults) and 2019 (students) with the exception of Music teacher5 who did not live in the UK at 13yrs, so class was determined by parents occupation. NB: Participant considered working class if lived in one of the 30% most deprived areas of England at 13yrs.

What is the Index of Multiple Deprivation (IMD)?

The Index of Multiple Deprivation, commonly known as the IMD, is the official measure of relative deprivation for small areas in England. It is the most widely used of the Indices of Deprivation (IoD) (described in Question 1). 5 The Index of Multiple Deprivation (IMD) ranks every small area in England from 1 (most deprived area) to 32,844 (least deprived area). These small areas are a statistical geography called Lower-layer Super Output Areas.

It is common to describe how relatively deprived a neighbourhood is by saying whether it falls among the most deprived 10 per cent, 20 per cent or 30 per cent of small areas in England (although there is no definitive cut-off at which an area is described as 'deprived')

The IoD2019 Explorer allows users to search by postcode or local authority area and view the relative deprivation of neighbourhoods according to both the IoD2019 and IoD2015 - IoD2019 Explorer - http://dclgapps.communities.gov.uk/imd/iod_index.html (see Question 5):

Users can enter a postcode or place name to see on a map the neighbourhood that the postcode or place lies in, and its deprivation rank. This information can be used to describe the relative level of deprivation in an area. For example: 9 Neighbourhood X is ranked 5,000 out of 32,844 neighbourhoods in England, where 1 is the most deprived.

It is common to describe how relatively deprived a neighbourhood is by saying whether it falls among the most deprived 10 per cent, 20 per cent or 30 per cent of small areas in England. To help with this, deprivation 'deciles' (defined in Question 9) allow you to describe an area as, for example, being amongst the 20 per cent most deprived neighbourhoods in the country.

If you are not using the explorer and its dashboard, you can also calculate this yourself as follows (with the same example of a neighbourhood ranked 5,000). 5,000/32,844 = 0.15 or 15% most deprived in England Hence this area lies within the 20% most deprived areas in England. The same methodology can be used to calculate whether an area is within the 1%, 10%, 25% most deprived in England, and so on.

To help with this, deprivation 'deciles' are published alongside ranks. Deciles are calculated by ranking the 32,844 neighbourhoods in England from most deprived to least deprived and dividing them into 10 equal groups. These range from the most deprived 10% of neighbourhoods nationally to the least deprived 10% of neighbourhoods nationally, as shown in the table below:

Decile	**Decile description**	**Ranks**
1	10% most deprived	1 to 3,284
2	10% to 20%	3,285 to 6,568
3	20% to 30%	6,569 to 9,853
4	30% to 40%	9,854 to 13,137
5		

	40% to 50%	13,138 to 16,422
6	50% to 60%	16,423 to 19,706
7	60% to 70%	19,707 to 22,990
8	70% to 80%	22,991 to 26,275
9	80% to 90%	26,276 to 29,559
10	10% least deprived	29,560 to 32,844

Users can apply different cut points to the ranks to identify, for example, the 1% or 5% most deprived neighbourhoods nationally:

Neighbourhoods falling in the 1% most deprived nationally would be those ranked 1- 328. The calculation is 32,844/100, because there are 32,844 small areas that need to be split into percentiles (100 equal groups).

Neighbourhoods falling in the 5% most deprived nationally would be those ranked 1- 1,642. The calculation is 32,844/20, because there are 32,844 small areas that need to be split into groups containing 5% of neighbourhoods (this is 20 equal groups, since 100/5=20).

Reference:

English Indices of Deprivation (2019)
https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/853811/IoD2019_FAQ_v4.pdf

Appendix G

Clustering of Themes for All Student Participants

Clustering of themes for Students

HELPFUL FACTORS/ POSITIVE FORCES FOR BLACK & ETHNIC MINORITY CHILDREN'S MUSIC EDUCATION
Parents involvement and attitude to music Engagement in music at/from Primary School Private instrument lessons
MUSIC IS OF GREAT IMPORTANCE TO YOUNG PEOPLE
It is involved in their daily lives and used for a number of reasons Relatability and connection to the artists/musicians they listen to is important Personal music tastes are very varied
BARRIERS TO BLACK & ETHNIC MINORITY CHILDREN'S MUSIC EDUCATION
An outdated curriculum* Difficulty level of GCSE music Attitude to music as a subject Normalizing of whiteness (lack of representation)
LACK OF DIVERSITY IN MUSIC EDUCATION
Teachers Content Teaching practices

Appendix H

Clustering of Themes for All Teacher Participants

Clustering of themes for Teachers

HELPFUL FACTORS/ POSITIVE FORCES IN THEIR OWN MUSIC EDUCATION
Parents Church/Community/Culture Early music engagement Informal music learning Formal music learning Supportive music teacher/mentor Opportunities and chances given
BARRIERS TO BLACK AND ETHINIC MINORITY MUSIC TEACHERS CAREER JOURNEY
Immigrant parents Finance Outdated music curriculum Difficulties accessing further music education
BARRIERS TO BLACK AND ETHNIC MINORITY PUPILS
Finance Class No private lessons Attitude to music as a subject Poor Primary School Music Education Outdated/out of touch Curriculum
RACE ISSUES IN MUSIC EDUCATION
Lack of role models Multiculturalism & tokenism Normalizing of whiteness Lack of representation of ethnic diversity A sense of not fitting in or belonging
PSYCHOLOGICAL FACTORS

Lack of self-belief Stereotypes and stereotype threat A need for multiple identities
SOLUTIONS TOWARDS A BETTER MUSIC EDUCATION FOR STUDENTS TODAY
More ethnically diverse music teachers as role models for pupils (rare breed) More diversity in curriculum content Challenge the normalizing of whiteness

Appendix I

Clustering of Themes for All Musician Participants

Clustering of themes for Musicians

BARRIERS FOR BLACK MUSICIANS IN MUSIC EDUCATION & CAREER PROGRESSION
Parents - Being children of 1st generation immigrants Intersection of class and race Systemic racism in education and employment Lack of representation and diversity in education and music industry Whiteness of the music curriculum
AGENCY FOR BLACK MUSICIANS IN MUSIC EDUCATION & CAREER PROGRESSION
Black culture Being given a chance or opportunity A supportive mentor or music teacher/teacher
PSYCHOLOGICAL EFFECTS (OF RACISM AND LACK OF REPRESENTATION & DIVERSTY IN EDUCATION AND THE MUSIC INDUSTRY)
A sense of not belonging or fitting in Having to have multiple identities Lack of self-belief (due to experiencing glass-ceiling effect)

Stress/strain
MUSIC EDUCATION RECOMMENDATIONS
High quality, subsidized instrument lessons Diversity in the syllabus More ethnically diverse teachers Greater accessibility to music via more diverse teaching practices Effort – because music education is important
MUSIC INDUSTRY RECOMMENDATIONS
Changing the gatekeepers More seats at the table Valuing black artists and their contribution to music Effort for meaningful change Resist stereotyping black artists

Appendix J

Use of the Word 'Coloured' in Title and Transcripts

*It was shocking to hear the term 'coloured' used in one of the focus group discussions, more so because it was used by a teenager, who was also black. Coloured was always considered an offensive term to use for black people when I was at school due to the links with colonialism and apartheid, however, I wonder how much knowledge today's students have of historic racism? The term was kept in the transcripts not to offend anyone or embarrass the participant who I actually believe was referring to 'people of different colours' but to also point to a periphery issue of terminology when it comes to race. It often presents yet another barrier to discourse on the subject of race but, I agree with the following advice which confirmed my decision to not edit out this terminology 'The important point when using and discussing words for talking about 'race' is to be continually receptive and sensitive to the words that other people use and their reactions to yours'

Reference:
https://www.cumbria.gov.uk/elibrary/Content/Internet/537/6381/6387/40828163633.pdf